Performance Audit
Minority and Women
Business Enterprise Program

April 2009

This document contains active links. For more information on how to navigate a PDF document please refer to PDF Navigation Instructions available through any of our Audit Reports pages.

City Auditor's Office

City of Kansas City, Missouri

April 15, 2009

Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council:

This performance audit of the city's Minority and Women Business Enterprise (MBE/WBE) program was initiated at the request of the City Council. This audit focuses on the major functions of the city's MBE/WBE programs: certification of firms, contract goals, performance monitoring, and reporting of results.

Firms have voiced frustration with the time - on average 115 days - it takes to be certified as an MBE/WBE and report losing out on contracting opportunities as a result. The Human Relations Division reports that most certification applications are submitted without adequate supporting documentation, while firms report that the division loses documentation. All certification files do not contain documentary evidence supporting proper certification. The division does not provide instructions and explanatory information with the application form. In addition, it has not developed written policies and procedures for processing applications nor established certification deadlines.

Departments are generally dissatisfied and mistrustful of the goal setting processes. Some departments believe that their expertise, experience, and responsibilities are disregarded. Goals setting and approval of contractor utilization plans takes time and sometimes delays the contracting process. Goals may not always reflect actual availability or an understanding of projects by division staff and can increase contract costs. Departments understand their responsibilities for obtaining goals and including goals in solicitation materials. They are less clear, however, about their responsibilities to assist contractors in navigating other portions of the division's process and the authority the division has to modify departmental submissions.

Neither the city manager nor the director of the human relations division have published utilization and progress reports required by resolution and ordinance. While division staff have begun implementing a new internet-based reporting and verification system to be used by prime and subcontractors, the division does not routinely verify contractor's self-reported information. Nor has the city enforced the liquidated damages provisions when contractual MBE/WBE commitments were not met.

Costs associated with the city's MBE/WBE/DBE program have been included in the overhead charges for some city construction projects, although many of the certified firms are not in construction-related businesses. While some entities do charge firms a certification fee, the city does not. Although the

Missouri Regional Certification Committee's DBE certification procedures prohibit imposing an application fee, neither the Code of Federal Regulations nor the city's code contain such a prohibition.

Both department staff and certified MBE/WBE firms have reported problems working with some members of the division staff. Some members of the division's staff have reportedly voiced biased opinions, acted in a biased manner, discouraged firms from seeking certification for some industries, and attempted to intimidate others.

This audit includes recommendations for improving the timeliness and effectiveness of the certifications and goals processes; charging fees for certification; and improving Human Relations' customer service.

We shared a draft of this report with the city manager and the director of the human relations division on February 18, 2009. Management's responses are appended. We would like to thank the Human Relations Division, other city staff, and local businesses and organizations for their assistance with this audit. The audit team for this project was Linna Hung and Nancy Hunt.

Gary L. White
City Auditor

Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program

Table of Contents

Introduction 1
- Objectives 1
- Scope and Methodology 1
- Background 2

Findings and Recommendations 6
- Summary 6
- Standards Need to Be Established for Certification Process 6
  - Certification Can Take a Long Time 7
  - Inadequate Documentation Can Delay Certifications 8
  - Human Relations Should Establish Certification Time Frames 9
  - Documentation in Some Certification Files Was Inadequate 10
- Departments Are Dissatisfied with Goal Setting Process 12
  - Goal Setting and Utilization Approvals Can Take a Long Time 12
  - Goals May Not Be Realistic 13
  - Goals Can Increase Costs 14
  - Procedures and Instructions for Goals Are Lacking 15
- Reporting, Monitoring, and Enforcement Need Improvement 16
  - Management Did Not Report Required MBE/WBE Information 17
  - MBE/WBE Program Lacks Consistent Monitoring 19
  - Liquidated Damages Provision Rarely Used 19
- Fees Should Be Charged for Certification 20
  - CIMO Projects Are Bearing MBE/WBE Program Costs 20
  - Fees Should Support the Certification Program 21
- Internal and External Customer Service Needs Improvement 22
  - Some Division Staff May Be Biased 23
  - Some Division Staff Can Be Difficult 23
- Recommendations 23

Appendix 26
- Management’s Response 26

Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program

List of Exhibits

Exhibit 1. Citywide MBE/WBE Goals 3
Exhibit 2. City-Certified Firms as of July 30, 2008 5
Exhibit 3. Calendar Days to Certify Firms Applying in 2007 7
Exhibit 4. Number of Firms Certified by Industry 21
Exhibit 5 Certified Firms by Location 22

Introduction

Objectives

We conducted this audit of the Minority and Women Business Enterprise (MBE/WBE) Program under the authority of Article II, Section 216 of the Charter of Kansas City, Missouri and at the direction of the City Council's Finance and Audit Committee following a partial waiver of the city's MBE/WBE goals for the Sprint Arena project.

A performance audit systematically examines evidence to independently assess the performance and management of a program against objective criteria. Performance audits provide information to improve program operations and facilitate decision-making.[1]

This report is designed to answer the following question:

- Do city departments and contractors follow the city's MBE/WBE guidelines outlined in the municipal code and contract guidebook to encourage minority and women owned business participation in city contracts?

Scope and Methodology

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Audit methods included the following:

- Reviewing selected sections of Contract Central materials, the Code of Ordinances, federal regulations, and Supreme Court cases.

- Reviewing the Human Relations Division's and operating departments' paper and electronic contracting files, and the division's online directory and certification files.

[1] Comptroller General of the United States, *Government Auditing Standards* (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office 2003), p. 21.

- Interviewing Human Relations Division staff, staff from city departments, and MBE/WBE firms.

No information was omitted from this report because it was deemed privileged or confidential.

Our review focuses on the city's MBE/WBE program. The division also is responsible for the city's Disadvantage Business Enterprise (DBE) program. The division uses the same forms, database, and personnel to administer both programs. Although some of our work includes comments related to both programs, we did not audit the city's DBE program.

Background

In 1989, the Supreme Court questioned the validity of a city's minority business enterprise program in *City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Company*. As a result, disparity studies were conducted nationwide by public entities to investigate and document the existence of disparities or discrimination in their jurisdictions.

In 1994, the City of Kansas City co-sponsored a disparity study with the Kansas City, Missouri, School District. The study found that minority and women owned business enterprises received significantly fewer contracts and contract dollars than expected, given their availability in the market.

In order to address this disparity, the city developed a Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program. The program was enacted under Chapter 38 of the city's Code of Ordinances on March 7, 1996. The most recent revisions became effective January 1, 2008.

The city's MBE/WBE program applies to all agency[2] or city construction contracts in excess of $275,000[3] and all other agency or city contracts in excess of $117,000, for which the majority is paid out of city funds or in which an agency is a party. Personal services contracts, emergency contracts, and petty cash funds are not subject to the program requirements.

[2] An agency is defined by Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec. 38-84(2), for the purposes of the city's MBE/WBE program, to be "Any public or private entity that receives sixty-six percent (66%) of its funding from the City or any entity with the authority to recommend City tax increment financing or City tax abatements."
[3] The threshold for construction contracts was set at $250,000 for 2008, increased to $275,000 for 2009, and will increase and remain at $300,000 beginning in 2010.

The city requires that each department director and agency head use good faith efforts to achieve citywide MBE/WBE goals by encouraging businesses to seek certification; advertising and notifying certified MBE/WBE firms of contracting opportunities; and working with the director of the Human Relations Division to shape contracts to enhance participation opportunities. (See Exhibit 1.)

Exhibit 1. Citywide MBE/WBE Goals

MBE/WBE Classification	Construction	Professional Services	Other Services	Materials & Supplies
African American	9%	8%	13%	9%
Hispanic American/Latino American	5%	3%	3%	3%
Native American/ Asian American/ Pacific Islander American	1%	2%	2%	2%
White Women	7%	8%	10%	9%

Source: Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec.38-86.

Citywide goals are the goals for total MBE/WBE participation in contracts. Citywide goals are not intended to limit contracting opportunities. Individual contract goals should be flexible and determined on a contract-by-contract basis. Individual contract goals are usually set as a single combined goal for minority firms and a separate goal for women firms.

Goals for city construction contracts with an estimated cost of more than $275,000[4] are recommended by the director of the city's Human Relations Division and established by the Fairness in Construction Board. The division director sets the goals for all other contracts as required.

When goals are set for a contract, bidders or proposers must meet or exceed the goals, or request a waiver and provide evidence of good faith efforts to meet the goals. The division director may recommend a full or partial waiver of contract goals when the bidder or proposer has not met the goals despite its good faith efforts. The City Council may waive contract goals when it is in the best interests of the city.

The city's MBE/WBE program requires that departments or agencies make reasonable efforts to enhance participation opportunities for qualified MBE/WBE firms. Minority and women owned businesses seeking recognition as an MBE or WBE firm must be certified by the division. Any person or business not certified by the division is not considered to be an MBE or WBE for program purposes.

[4] The threshold for construction contracts was set at $250,000 for 2008, increased to $275,000 for 2009, and will increase and remain at $300,000 beginning in 2010.

The city's Human Relations Division is responsible for certifying eligible businesses as minority or women owned firms; setting goals for individual contracts to ensure certified firms participate in the city's contracting opportunities; and monitoring and reporting utilization.

A person or enterprise seeking the city's MBE/WBE certification must demonstrate that:

- It is at least 51 percent owned, managed, and independently controlled by one or more minorities or one or more women;
- It is an existing for-profit business with a real and substantial presence in the Kansas City metropolitan area;
- It has suffered from past race or gender discrimination in the city and in the applicable trade or industry;
- It meets the business size standards of 13 CFR 121.201 and the city's ordinance as of the date of the application[5];
- It has the skills and expertise to perform as a subcontractor in the work for which it is seeking certification.

The division is also responsible for the city's Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) program. A DBE must meet the federal program requirements. The requirements are similar to those of the city's MBE/WBE program except the firm must be owned, managed, and controlled by one or more individuals who are both socially and economically disadvantaged; and the net worth of the owners is limited.

As of July 30, 2008, the city's online directory included 735 businesses certified by the division with 1,196 certifications. Forty percent of the firms were certified as MBEs, and 26 percent as WBEs. All but 26 firms were certified as DBEs. (See Exhibit 2.)

[5] Under section 38-100.4(t)(2) of the Code of Ordinances, a firm that grows to exceed the business size standard may be retained in the MBE/WBE program for three years after the division notifies the firm that it has graduated from the program. A DBE firm must be within the business size standards.

Exhibit 2. City-Certified Firms as of July 30, 2008

Certification Type	Firms Certified	
	Number	Percentage
Minority Business Enterprise	296	40%
Women Business Enterprise	190	26%
Disadvantaged Business Enterprise	709	96%
Airport Concessionaire Disadvantaged Business Enterprise	1	.1%
Total Businesses Certified	735	
Total Certifications	1,196	

Source: HRD Online Directory (Duplicate entries deleted.[6])

Back to Table of Contents

[6] The number of firms is the count of individual firms listed in the directory by certification type. The directory sometimes contained more than one entry for a single firm under a single certification type. When this occurred, we counted the firm's certification only once. For example, if firm ABC was listed in the directory twice with an MBE certification, we counted the firm as only a single MBE firm. Most of the duplication was related to differing certification and expiration dates.

Findings and Recommendations

Summary

Firms seeking Minority or Women Business Enterprise (MBE/WBE) status and city departments contracting for goods and services both complain that the city's processes take too long. The division has not developed written instructions for firms applying for MBE/WBE certification or written policies and procedures for staff to follow in certifying firms or setting individual contracting goals. The division and city manager have also not reported MBE/WBE program information as required by resolution and ordinance.

In recent years, the division has taken steps to improve consistency in written certification documentation, file organization, and the online directory of MBE/WBE firms. The city's code sections related to MBE/WBE/DBE processes and requirements have also been revised. While some improvements have been made, more remains to be done.

The director of the human relations division should develop written policies and procedures; adopt the application form and instructions contained in the CFR for DBE applicants for use in the city's MBE/WBE/DBE programs; use the standard time frames developed for DBE application processing; improve contract monitoring; improve the communications and understanding between contracting departments and division staff; charge fees for certifications; and establish and strengthen the division's customer service perspectives.

Standards Need to Be Established for Certification Process

Firms have voiced frustration with the time it takes to be certified as an MBE/WBE or DBE and report having lost out on contracting opportunities because they were not certified in a timely manner. Certifications could be processed more efficiently if the city used the application, instructions, checklist, and explanatory information required by the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) and adopted the processing time frame requirements of the CFR and Missouri Regional Certification Committee. Written policies and procedures should also be adopted to support consistency in processing and documentation.

Certification Can Take a Long Time

Firms have voiced frustration with the time it takes for the city to process MBE/WBE/DBE applications. On average, it took the division more than three months to certify firms that submitted applications in 2007. Firms report that they lost out on contracting opportunities because they were not certified in a timely manner.

Firms have voiced frustration with the time it takes for the city to process applications. In 2007, the division received 200 new certification applications. As of May 2008, no determination had been made for 63 of the new applications, 17 were denied, 38 were permanently closed, 4 were withdrawn, and 78 of the businesses were certified. Certification took from 18 to 326 days, with a majority of the certifications taking more than 90 days. (See Exhibit 3.)

Exhibit 3. Calendar Days to Certify Firms Applying in 2007

Calendar Days to Certify	Firms Certified within Time frame	
	Number	Percent
Less than 30 days	11	14%
31 – 60 days	15	19%
61 – 90 days	9	12%
91 - 180 days	25	32%
181 – 326 days	18	23%
Total	78	100%

Source: HRD 2008 Master Certification File May 14, 2008 and CAO calculations.

According to the Human Relations Division's *Contracting Guide 2007*, published for vendors and companies interested in pursing city contracts, the certification process takes approximately 30 days. Only 14 percent of the firms that submitted an application to the city for certification in 2007 were certified within 30 days.

Certification delays may prevent participation in contracting opportunities. Firms report that they have lost out on contracting opportunities because they were not certified in time to participate as an MBE/WBE firm. In order to credit a firm's participation toward the city's MBE/WBE participation goals, the firm must be certified by the date that the response to the solicitation is due. Contractors seeking contracts with other area entities also want MBE/WBE firms to be certified before including them in the contractor's solicitation response. With about a fourth of the certifications taking six months or more to complete, it is not surprising that firms report contracting opportunities have been lost.

Inadequate Documentation Can Delay Certifications

The division closes most certification files at least temporarily because complete documentation is unavailable for review. According to division staff, most applicants fail to submit all of the required documentation with their application. According to applicants, submitted documentation is lost by the division. The application form used by the city does not include instructions or explanatory information that could assist potential applicants. In addition, the application form used by the city is not the application form required by the Code of Federal Regulations for DBE certifications.

Division staff claim most applications lack adequate documentation. In order to be certified as a minority, woman, or disadvantaged business enterprise by the division, businesses are required to complete an application, supply supporting documents, and have a site visit. The division reports closing files when complete supporting documentation is not available for review. Most applicants' files are set aside or temporarily "administratively closed" during the certification process. Division staff administratively closed about 90 percent of the new applications for certification received in 2007.

Applicants claim the division loses documentation. Applicants have complained that they submit the requested documentation and are later asked to provide the same documentation. While the division now has a standard method of filing documentation, there is no way to verify whether or not documentation was submitted or lost.

Instructions should be included with the certification application. Neither the application form on the city's web site nor the form provided by division staff to walk-in MBE/WBE applicants contain instructions on how to complete the multi-page application. The application also fails to define who is eligible to be certified. The director of the human relations division should develop and include instructions and explanatory information with MBE/WBE certification application materials to assist firms in completing applications, knowing what documentation is needed, and understanding whether or not the firm qualifies for certification.

The division should use the correct application form. The city uses the same application form for the certification of disadvantaged (DBE), minority (MBE), and women (WBE) business enterprises. Since July 2003, the Code of Federal Regulations has required that agencies certifying DBE firms use the *Uniform Certification Application.*[7] The

[7] 49 CFR 26 Appendix F (2007).

Uniform Certification Application consists of the application and supporting documentation checklist, plus instructions, a roadmap explaining who should apply, links to additional pertinent information, and warnings related to providing false or incorrect information on the application. The CFR requires the use of the *Uniform Certification Application* for DBE certifications "without change or revision,"[8] but does permit agencies to request additional information to supplement the form with the approval of the operating administration.

Although the city performs DBE certifications, they are not using the *Uniform Certification Application*. To comply with federal regulations, ensure that certifications are properly documented, and give applicants adequate information on eligibility, potential liability, and a complete list of required documentation, the director of the human relations division should adopt the *Uniform Certification Application* for city processed applications.

Human Relations Should Establish Certification Time Frames

While the city has not established time frames for the MBE/WBE certification process, the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) and the Missouri Regional Certification Committee (MRCC) both have established time frames for processing DBE applications. Since the city currently uses the same applications for all three types of certifications and most firms are certified by the city as both DBE and MBE/WBE businesses, the city should adopt the processing deadlines used by the CFR and MRCC.

The CFR limits processing times for certifying agencies. Under 49 CFR 26.83(k) the city must make decisions on applications for DBE certification within 90 days of receiving all information required by the CFR. The time period may be extended once by written notice for no more than an additional 60 days. Because firms are dissatisfied with the length of time it takes to become certified and because most MBE/WBE firms certified by the city are also DBE certified, the director of the human relations division should adopt the processing time requirements contained in the CFR.

The MRCC limits the times for applicants to submit documentation. The CFR also requires that the city, as a recipient of Department of Transportation financial assistance participate in a Unified Certification Program. The city has entered into a Memorandum of Understanding with other DBE certifying agencies in the state of Missouri forming the

[8] 49 CFR 26.83(c)(7)(j) (2007). There is an exception for Small Business Administration (SBA) firms certified for either 8(a)BD or SDB programs.

Missouri Regional Certification Committee (MRCC). Rules from this committee also establish time frames for DBE applicants to submit required documentation.

The Human Relations Division cannot certify a firm until it has reviewed the firm's application and all necessary supporting documentation and conducted a site visit. For DBE applications, the city must notify the applicant when documentation is needed, and under the MRCC's rules, the applicant has 10 days to submit the requested information or offer a reasonable explanation for a delay. If the information or justification is not received within 10 working days, a final request is supposed to be made via certified mail. This final request gives the applicant 5 working days to provide the information. Failure to submit the requested information at the end of 5 days will result in denial of the firm's DBE application. The Human Relations Division has not followed these documentation time requirements.

The MRCC Certification Agreement states that agency compliance with the Unified Certification Process is necessary to maintain its success. The agreement also provides that any agency that fails to comply with the agreement's minimum requirements may be subject to remedial measures including not accepting firms certified by that agency.

To ensure that the DBE certifications performed by the division are recognized and to limit applicant confusion by adopting a consistent standard for DBE and MBE/WBE applications, the director of the human relations division should adopt the MRCC's documentation time limits for applicants.

Documentation in Some Certification Files Was Inadequate

Some certification files were missing required documentation. Not all files contained evidence supporting certification decisions. In addition the MBE/WBE staff does not have written policies and procedures for the certification process.

Some certification files were missing required documents. We reviewed files for currently certified MBE/WBE firms to determine whether the division has adequate documentation to support certification decisions. Several of the files reviewed did not contain required paperwork. Missing documents included individual and business tax returns; business licenses; and salary schedules for officers, managers, owners, and directors of the firm. Files for trucking firms certified as disadvantaged business enterprises also lacked required proof of insurance.

Division employees report that the consistency of required documentation included in certification files has improved. Division staff have standardized the documentation requested and how documentation is maintained. Firms that may have been originally certified with an application and a note from the previous director are now being asked to provide required documentation as annual reviews and the three-year renewals are processed.

The city inappropriately certified MBE/WBE firms located outside of the metropolitan area. Documentation contained in files and instructions given to staff regarding the certification of MBE/WBE firms located outside the metropolitan area were inconsistent. Certification files for several of these businesses do not contain adequate evidence that the firms qualified for MBE/WBE certification under the city's ordinance.

Four firms certified under the requirements of the city's MBE/WBE ordinance prior to January 2008, did not have their principal places of business in the Kansas City area and their certification files did not prove by a preponderance of evidence a substantial effort to become a market participant.[9] Revisions to the city's MBE/WBE ordinance, which became effective January 1, 2008, establish more stringent requirements, but permits previously certified firms to retain their certification until their certification expires.

Not all files contained evidence for certification decisions. Some of the files reviewed contained recommendations from contract compliance officers to deny certifications for the firms; however, the firms were subsequently certified with no additional support for the decision or without information addressing the reasons for the original denial recommendation.

The MBE/WBE program staff does not have written policies and procedures for the certification process. Policies and procedures contribute to internal control activities that enforce management directives and are an integral part of achieving effective results. The lack of written policies and procedures for the certification staff could lead to inconsistent certification practices, resulting in the certification of firms that do not meet the city's eligibility standards or the rejection of qualified firms.

[9] Section 38-100.2 (b) of the Code of Ordinances. "Such evidence may include, but is not limited to: contracts with entities located in the city; attempts to bid on or respond to solicitations from entities in the city; advertising the firm's goods or services in the city; or any other activity designed to continually seek business opportunities in the city, such that the firm would likely be subject to the discrimination sought to be remedied by this article."

In order to ensure complete and consistent certification practices, the director of the human relations division should develop written policies and procedures for processing MBE/WBE/DBE applications.

Departments Are Dissatisfied with Goal Setting Process

Departments are generally dissatisfied and mistrustful of the goal setting process. Goal setting and approval of contractor utilization plans can delay the contracting process. Operating departments believe that their expertise and responsibilities are disregarded by the division during the goal setting process. Goals do not always reflect actual MBE/WBE availability and can increase the cost of city contracts. Departments understand their responsibilities for obtaining goals and including goals in solicitation materials. There are, however, no written standards on how to complete forms; the authority that the division has in directing changes to departmental developed goal recommendations; or division and department responsibilities to assist contractors during parts of the contracting process.

Goal Setting and Utilization Approvals Can Take a Long Time

Departments build months into their contracting schedules to compensate for the time it takes to obtain MBE/WBE participation goals and utilization approvals. The division requires departments to physically pick up goals rather than adopting electronic alternatives.

Goal setting and utilization approvals delay city contracts. Some departments build months into their contracting schedules to compensate for the time it takes to obtain MBE/WBE participation goals and utilization approvals. While some MBE/WBE goals are set within the division's goal of a 7-day turn-around, and the approval of Contractor Utilization Plans sometimes meets the division's goal of a 14-day turn-round, the division has taken months to set some goals and more than a month to approve contractor's plans. Although the division has taken steps to control the work flow within the division and focus on more timely setting and reviews of goals, the time taken for individual contracts varies and can exceed the division's goals.

The division requires some departments to physically pick up goals. Although the division wants to receive goal requests by email to track the receipt and assignment of goals to staff, the division is inconsistent in how it returns goals to departments. Because of the division's past experience with departments claiming that they did not receive goals that the division believed had been distributed, some departments must

physically send an employee or hire a courier to sign for the goal sheet in the division's offices.

The division will email departments a notification when goal requests are ready to be picked up, but will not email, fax, or mail goals to all operating departments. With available methods of documenting electronic delivery of information, and to save time for departments and reduce trips to city hall, the director of the human relations division should develop a method of providing goals to departments without requiring departments to physically pick them up.

Goals May Not Be Realistic

The division's online directory, which is used to identify potential MBE/WBE subcontractors, is not always complete and accurate. The broad classifications used in the city's directory, limited understanding of project requirements by division staff, and minimal consultation with departmental staff can combine to produce goals that do not accurately reflect the availability of certified firms that are ready, willing, and able to perform.

The division's directory is not complete and accurate. In April 2008, 21 of the 578 firms in the division's online directory did not have an industry classification code attached to their listing identifying the type of goods and services they were certified to provide and 43 of the MBE/WBE firms did not have a current certification. In addition, the North American Industry Classification System (NAICS) used to describe and classify the work performed by each certified firm can be too broad to identify the specific qualifications required for the project, giving the illusion of availability.

The division maintains an online directory of MBE/WBE and DBE firms. To be counted as an MBE/WBE firm on city projects, the firm must be certified by the division and listed in the division's directory. The directory can be used by operating departments, contractors, and the public to identify available firms. The city's individual contract goals are determined by analyzing the number and types of qualified, certified firms available to perform work or portions of it.

When assigning individual contract goals, ensuring only certified firms' contract participation is counted, or attempting to identify potential subcontractors, a search of the division's online directory could provide inaccurate information. The director of the human relations division should ensure that the directory is complete and accurate.

Division staff do not always understand the proposed scope of work. Without a basic understanding of the goods or services being sought, the goals assigned by division staff may not be reasonable. The division has separated work into segments when the items or service being purchased cannot be divided among firms. In addition, the division has assigned both an MBE and WBE goal when the work will be performed by a single individual. Without comprehending the essential elements of a project, work can be divided into segments that do not reflect the basic goods or services the department is seeking. Although some division staff work with departments to understand project requirements when recommending MBE/WBE goals, others do not.

The division seldom utilizes departmental project knowledge. Some operating departments believe that division staff often disregard departmental expertise during the goal setting process. The division has established goals that do not reflect actual availability of qualified firms, and without understanding the specific qualifications or specialized certifications needed for the engagement. Some departments report contacting upper level Human Relations Division management for modifications of goals that are problematic. Other departments' staff are frustrated and report being powerless in the goal setting process. They are resigned to a situation in which some division staff do not want to listen to or understand departments' concerns. In addition, departmental staffs were also concerned about the division's disregard for budget constraints and operating and maintenance considerations when setting goals.

Goals Can Increase Costs

The cost of goods and services obtained from the city are sometimes higher because of MBE/WBE goals. When the number of available certified subcontractors is limited, the demand for their services can result in higher costs.

MBE/WBE goals can increase the cost of a contract. There are costs to doing business with the city. For projects that have an MBE/WBE goal, prime contractors are required to seek certified MBE/WBE subcontractors and both prime and subcontractors have reporting requirements. Although in theory, the use of an MBE/WBE contractor to perform a portion of the contract could merely result in the performance of a discrete portion of a contract by the subcontractor, it can increase project costs and result in the rejection of lower cost vendors.

Prime contractors with knowledge of the city's processes will include the costs of fulfilling city requirements in calculating bids and proposals. In

one service contract, a prime contractor added about 10 percent to his pricing when MBE and WBE goals totaling about 18 percent were assigned to a contract. In another contract a department reported that they were unable to divide a contract between two vendors in order to reduce the city's total costs and increase MBE/WBE participation because one firm did not meet the division's good faith efforts criteria, while the second firm received a waiver.

Subcontractors can wield power when there are few certified alternatives. When the number of subcontractors within a service or product category is limited, contract costs can increase. To meet the MBE/WBE goals for some contracts when availability of service providers is limited, subcontractors may only be willing to perform the work at a price higher than the price the prime contractor is willing to charge to perform the same task. In some instances these unions result in subcontractors who do not believe that they have been given the chance to fully perform under the contract and prime contractors who believe that subcontractors have not provided timely performance. These situations can cause tensions between the prime and subcontractors and increase costs.

Procedures and Instructions for Goals Are Lacking

Departments understand their responsibilities for obtaining goals and included goals in solicitation materials. There are, however, no written standards describing how goal requests should be completed, the authority that the division has in directing changes to departmental developed goal recommendations, or division and department responsibilities.

The division has not provided instructions for goal requests. Although departments report that there are unwritten rules on how some standard costs are to be segmented or not segmented for goal requests, there are no written instructions. Written instructions should set basic expectations on what the division looks for in reviewing goal requests, explicitly state rules that are now used, and include an initial list of basic terms that are common to the segmentation of projects. Instructions could also standardize submissions from departments, establish a common basis of understanding, and prevent delays in goal setting.

Responsibilities and authority need clarification. Departments voiced support for MBE/WBE participation in city contracting opportunities. Department staff understood the need to complete specific forms and when to include goals and standard forms and instructions with solicitation materials. Department staffs were uncertain, however, about

department and division roles and responsibilities and the division's authority during other portions of the process. Department staff are also concerned about the independence of division staff since the division certifies firms, set goals, and approves contractor utilization plans.

Operating departments do not agree with all actions taken by Human Relations Division staff. Some division staff has refused to accept the goal request forms prepared by departments. Some division staff have also changed the contract amount and the scope of work used as the basis for goal setting without talking to the department. Such rejections and modifications can give subsequent reviewers the false impression that the department and division agree when they do not agree and are not required to agree.

Without written policies, departments do not know what their role should be in monitoring contract participation. Departments also did not want to inappropriately interfere, slow down the contracting process, or provide incorrect information to potential contractors, but report they are sometimes asked by contractors for assistance in working with the division.

Instructions and procedures should be established after consultation with operating departments. The MBE/WBE program would benefit from the development of written instructions and policies and procedures following discussions among departments to clarify and specify responsibilities of the division and operating department staffs. The director of the human relations division should work with departments to better understand the contracting responsibilities and needs of operating departments; develop written instructions providing direction and written policies and procedures defining the responsibilities and authority of operating departments and the Human Relations Division during the MBE/WBE contracting process; and offer training on the MBE/WBE program and processes through the city's Contract Training Academy.

Reporting, Monitoring, and Enforcement Need Improvement

Neither the city manager nor the director of the human relations division has met the reporting requirements established by resolution and ordinance. Although contractors have been required to provide monthly utilization reports, the information is self-reported and not verified.

City contracts are supposed to include a liquidated damages clause that would apply when a prime contractor does not achieve MBE/WBE utilization levels included in the contract. Although contracts have not

always met their contract utilization levels, the city does not usually seek liquidated damages.

Management Did Not Report Required MBE/WBE Information

Neither the city manager nor the director of the human relations division have fulfilled their MBE/WBE reporting obligations. The city manager has not provided monthly reports to the City Council required by resolution. The director of human relations has not issued quarterly and annual reports required by city ordinance.

The city manager has not provided required monthly MBE/WBE progress reports to the City Council. Resolution 060480, which was adopted in May 2006, directs the city manager to report to the City Council monthly "on the progress being made on the achievement of MBE/WBE goals and, if applicable, workforce utilization goals on each construction project on the Capital Improvements Management Office web site." The reports are to include the name and total budget by project; MBE/WBE goals; percentage of MBE/WBE cumulative dollars spent to total project budget; and the amount of dollars left in the proposed MBE/WBE and combined project budget. Additional information related to workforce utilization goals is also required. After we sent a confirmation letter asking the city manager to verify that he had not fulfilled the monthly reporting requirements of the resolution, the division's web site was updated. Monthly Contract Utilization Reports for July 2007 through April 2008 were added. The utilization reports were not provided to the City Council on a monthly schedule and the amount of dollars left in the proposed MBE/WBE and combined project budget were not provided in the report. The city manager should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by resolution.

The director of the human relations division has not provided quarterly and annual reports as required. City ordinances require that the director publish an annual report[10] for the city's fiscal year for each city department and provide a quarterly compliance report[11] to the city manager within 30 days after the end of the quarter. The director is also to furnish assistance to the Fairness in Construction Board including providing interim reports and updating the annual report information within 30 days following the end of each quarter.[12]

[10] Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec. 38-100.5(c)(6). Prior to the revision effective January 1, 2008, the director was required to complete the annual report by July 1 of each year.
[11] Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec 38-100.5(c)(7).
[12] Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec 38-100.5(c)(9).

The annual report is supposed to include the following for each city department and agency:

- The number of contracts awarded and the total contract dollars awarded pursuant to such contracts;
- The number of prime contracts awarded to WBEs and MBEs as identified by race and/or ethnicity and the total dollars awarded and paid pursuant to such contracts;
- The number of subcontracts awarded to WBEs and MBEs as identified by race and/or ethnicity and the total dollars awarded and paid pursuant to such contracts;
- A summary of total waiver requests submitted and the reasons waivers were granted or denied; and
- The number of MBE/WBE firms certified by race and/or ethnicity.

The quarterly compliance report requires:

- The total number of contracts awarded and the total contract dollar amount awarded pursuant to such contracts;
- The number of contracts awarded to qualified MBEs as identified by race and/or ethnicity and to qualified WBEs, and the total contract dollar amount awarded and paid pursuant to such contracts;
- The director of human relations' evaluation of the city's progress toward meeting MBE/WBE utilization plans and any actions he or she intends to take to address any shortfall in meeting the goals established in such plans; and
- Any other information as may be required by the city manager.

After we sent letters to the director to confirm that the required reporting was not taking place, communications with updated information for May 2003 through September 2008 were provided to the City Council, mayor, city manager, and City Auditor's Office. These communications and recent web site updates, however, did not contain all of the information required by ordinance. The reports did not contain the number of prime contracts and the number of subcontracts awarded to WBEs and MBEs by race and ethnicity, waiver statistics, and the number of MBE/WBE firms by race and ethnicity. In addition, the director did not provide any evidence that he had submitted quarterly reports. The director of the human relations division should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by ordinance.

MBE/WBE Program Lacks Consistent Monitoring

The potential for inaccurate reporting of actual participation exists. While prime contractors are required to submit a monthly utilization report, neither the city nor the MBE/WBE subcontractors verify the contract amounts and payments reported. Some minority subcontractors have alleged that contractors overreport minority participation. The city has also received a complaint that a prime contractor had asked the minority subcontractor to falsify his participation and payment amounts on a city contract.

Division staff has been working on using B2GNow to monitor all city contracts with MBE/WBE participation goals and payments. B2GNow would require MBE/WBE subcontractors to enter the system and verify payments reported by the prime contractors. While requiring a subcontractor to verify payments is an improvement over unverified prime contractor submitted information, without verification by an independent third party, reported levels of participation depend on the honesty of the reporting entity.

Setting goals is only one step in encouraging minority and women business participation in city contracts. MBE/WBE firms will not be able to develop capacity if they do not actually perform. The director of the human relations division should perform random audits of a few contracts each year to verify reported results are accurate and establish sanctions for misrepresentation. If intentional misrepresentations are identified, the director should seek appropriate sanctions.

Liquidated Damages Provision Rarely Used

The city rarely assesses liquidated damages when prime contractors do not achieve MBE/WBE goals. All city contracts that contain MBE/WBE goals are supposed to contain a liquidated damages provision in the event the contractor fails to achieve the MBE/WBE participation specified in the *Contractor Utilization Plan*.[13] According to the division, the city has exercised its power to assess liquidated damages for failure to achieve contractual MBE/WBE participation goals only once.

While change orders and other adjustments can alter the initial and final goals for a project, the city manager should consider recovering liquidated damages when contractual MBE/WBE commitments are not met. A review of five contracts reported in the division's Monthly Utilization Report suggests that the city might have been able to recover liquated damages of almost $200,000 had it chosen to pursue these

[13] Code of Ordinances, Kansas City, Missouri, Sec. 38-96,

claims. The city manager should determine when the city should appropriately seek liquidated damages.

Fees Should Be Charged for Certification

Costs associated with the city's MBE/WBE/DBE program have been included in the overhead charges for city construction projects handled through the Capital Improvements Management Office (CIMO), although many of the certified firms are not in construction-related businesses. Only about one-half of the firms listed in the city's online directory were located in Kansas City, Missouri. Some entities certifying firms do charge fees. The city's code of ordinances does not prohibit fees. The Code of Federal Regulations permits fees to be charged for certification of DBE firms, although the Missouri Regional Certification Committee currently prohibits fees.

CIMO Projects Are Bearing MBE/WBE Program Costs

MBE/WBE program costs have been included as a part of the city's Capital Improvement Management Office's (CIMO) overhead charges. In fiscal year 2008, almost $538,000 of MBE/WBE/DBE program costs were charged to CIMO and allocated to construction projects managed by CIMO. It is not clear why city construction projects managed by CIMO[14] are used to support a program that certifies firms that are not in construction related businesses.

Not all certified firms are in construction-related industries. Of the 765 certified firms in the online directory, approximately 26 percent of the firms are classified in the construction industry. Another 26 percent of the firms are categorized in the Professional, Scientific, and Technical (PST) services classification. (See Exhibit 4). The PST classification includes categories related to construction such as architects and engineers, but also includes categories unrelated to construction such as lobbying, public relations and marketing. Other classifications also contain construction and non-construction businesses. It is not appropriate to charge CIMO the cost of the MBE/WBE certification process when not all the entities are construction related.

[14] Our 2008 *Capital Improvement Management Office Follow-up* reported that not all departments with capital dollars use CIMO. Some city departments with large capital project budgets have chosen to manage their own projects rather than using CIMO.

Exhibit 4. Number of Firms Certified by Industry

Industry	Number of Firms	Percentage of Firms
Professional, Scientific and Technical Services	200	26.1%
Construction	197	25.8%
Administrative and Support and Waste Management and Remediation Services	97	12.7%
Wholesale Trades	62	8.1%
Transportation and Warehousing	47	6.1%
Manufacturing	42	5.5%
Retail Trades	24	3.1%
Other Services (except Public Administration)	23	3.0%
Real Estate and Rental and Leasing	21	2.7%
Finance and Insurance	12	1.6%
Educational Services	12	1.6%
Information	8	1.0%
Arts, Entertainment and Recreation	7	0.9%
Accommodation and Food Service	6	0.8%
Health Care and Social Assistance	3	0.4%
Public Administration	3	0.4%
Mining	1	0.1%
Total	765	100.0%

Source: HRD spreadsheet April 2008 and CAO calculations.

Fees Should Support the Certification Program

Only about half of the firms certified by city staff are located in Kansas City, Missouri. Although the city does not charge firms a fee for certification, other entities charge fees. The city's ordinance is silent on charging fees for MBE/WBE certifications. The Code of Federal Regulations permits fees to be charged for certification of DBE firms, although the Missouri Regional Certification Committee currently prohibits fees.

Other entities charge certification fees. The city's ordinance is silent on charging a fee for MBE/WBE certifications. Other certifying agencies charge fees ranging from $200 to $275 for certifications and $50 to $275 for annual renewals.

The city is currently prohibited from charging fees for DBE certifications based on its membership in the Missouri Regional Certification Committee. The committee's Uniform Certification Program Policies and Procedures state that the "MRCC will not impose an application fee for firms to participate in the DBE certification process." However, subject to the approval of the concerned operating administration as part

of the DBE program, the Code of Federal Regulations[15] would permit the city to impose a reasonable application fee for certification, with waiver of the fee in appropriate cases.

Half of the city certified firms are not located in Kansas City, Missouri. About 42 percent of the firms were located in either other Missouri locations or Kansas, and about 7 percent were from other states and the District of Columbia. (See Exhibit 5.) The city should not bear the full cost of certifying firms that are located outside of Kansas City, Missouri.

Exhibit 5. Certified Firms by Location

Location of Firm	Number of Firms	Percentage of Firms
Kansas City, Missouri	377	51%
Missouri Excluding Kansas City	141	19%
Kansas	167	23%
Other States and Washington DC	50	7%
Total	735	100%

Source: HRD Online Directory, July 2008, and CAO calculations.

Fees should be charged to support the certification program. To more closely match the cost of the program to those who seek to benefit, the city manager should develop and seek the adoption of a reasonable fee structure for MBE/WBE certifications and develop a fee structure for DBE certifications pending the reversal of the Missouri Regional Certification Committee's restriction.[16] The director of the human relations division should propose to the Missouri Regional Certification Committee that it revise its policies and procedures to permit the adoption of a reasonable fee for the DBE certification process consistent with the requirements of the CFR.

Internal and External Customer Service Needs Improvement

Both city operating department staff and certified firms have reported problems with some member of the Human Relations Division staff. Some division staff have voiced biased opinions, acted in a biased manner, and have attempted to intimidate others.

[15] 49 CFR 26.83 (f).

[16] The Hancock Amendment can require voter approval of increases in rates charged for services when a "fee" is determined to be a tax. The Missouri Supreme Court has held that the phrase "taxes, licenses or fees" used in Article X, Section 22(a) of the Missouri Constitution may mean just "taxes." The court established a five-part test to examine a license or a fee to determine whether it was really a tax or a license or fee. Establishing or increasing a tax would require voter approval while a license or fee would not.

Some Division Staff May Be Biased

Some city staff and certified firms have reported that division staff support the use of the MBE/WBE program for some minorities but not others. One certified firm reported being told by division staff that the staff member did not feel that other minority groups have been discriminated against—only African-Americans.

City staff has reported that the behaviors of a Human Relations Division staff member during pre-bid conferences are "embarrassing" and racially charged. Some firms also report having been discouraged by division staff from seeking certifications in some industries because another firm was already providing that good or service.

Some Division Staff Can Be Difficult

Both local firms and city staff have indicated that some of the division staff are vindictive and difficult to work with. Individuals interviewed during the audit process have reported that the division does not take criticism well. Both local firms and operating departments have expressed fear of retaliation from some staff. City staff have called working with the division a "nightmare" and said that some staff used intimidation. Firms report that division staff do not always return phone calls and are not honest in the reason given for delays in processing certifications.

To ensure equal treatment and promote an equitable certification process, the director of the human relations division should establish an appropriate customer service atmosphere supported by employee training and tying customer service to employees' annual reviews.

Recommendations

1. The director of the human relations division should develop and include instructions and explanatory information with MBE/WBE certification application materials to assist firms in completing all application package documents and understanding whether or not the firm qualifies for certification.

2. The director of the human relations division should adopt the Code of Federal Regulations' *Uniform Certification Application* for city processed applications.

3. The director of the human relations division should adopt the certification time frame requirements of the Code of Federal Regulations and of Missouri's Unified Certification Program for DBE/MBE/WBE processing.

4. The director of the human relations division should develop written policies and procedures for processing MBE/WBE/DBE applications.

5. The director of the human relations division should develop a reasonable method of providing goals to departments without requiring departments to physically pick up goals from city hall.

6. The director of the human relations division should ensure that the online directory is complete and accurate.

7. The director of the human relations division should work with departments to better understand the contracting responsibilities and needs of operating departments; develop written policies and procedures defining the responsibilities of operating departments and the human relations division during the MBE/WBE contracting process; and offer training on the MBE/WBE program and processes through the city's Contract Training Academy.

8. The city manager should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by resolution 060480.

9. The director of the human relations division should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by ordinance.

10. The director of human relations division should perform random audits of a few contracts each year to verify that reported MBE/WBE participation results are accurate. Penalties for intentional misrepresentation should be developed and enforced.

11. The city manager should determine when to seek liquidated damages for unmet contractual MBE/WBE commitments.

12. The city manager should develop and adopt a reasonable fee structure for MBE/WBE certifications.

13. The director of the human relations division should propose to the Missouri Regional Certification Committee that it revise its policies and procedures to permit the adoption of a reasonable fee for the DBE certification process consistent with the requirements of the CFR.

14. The director of the human relations division should establish an appropriate customer service atmosphere supported with employee training and annual reviews.

Back to Table of Contents

Appendix

Management’s Response

Human Relations Department

RECEIVED
APR 3 2009
CITY AUDITOR'S OFFICE

Date: March 10, 2009

To: Gary White, City Auditor

From: Wayne Cauthen, City Manager
Phillip Yelder, Director Human Relations

Subject: Response to Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program Audit Finding

REVISED April 3, 2009

This memorandum is in response to your letter dated February 18, 2009 regarding the City Auditor's review of the Human Relations Department's Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program operation.

This report identified fourteen recommendations to the City Manager and Director of Human Relations Division. Attached below are our responses and supporting documentation.

Recommendation 1. The Director of Human Relations should develop and include instructions and explanatory information with MBE/WBE certification application to assist firms in completing all application package documents and understanding whether or not the firm qualifies for certification.

Response: **Agree**

HRD developed an introduction letter from the Director and a one page description of the certification program and process, and has been distributing it with the application to potential applicants. In response to this recommendation, HRD revised its application packet to not only include the previously described introduction letter and one page program description, but also to include the instructions and roadmap to the Uniform Certification Application from the Code of Federal Regulations. The current application packet is attached as Exhibit 1.

Recommendation 2. The Director of Human Relations should adopt the Code of Federal Regulations "Uniform Certification Application" for city processed applications.

Response: **Agree**

In response to this recommendation, HRD revised its application packet to adopt the Code of Federal Regulations "Uniform Certification Application" for city processed applications. As noted above, the current application packet is attached as Exhibit 1.

Recommendation 3. The Director of Human Relations should adopt the certification timeframe requirements of the Code of Federal Regulations and of Missouri Unified Certification Program for DBE/MBE/WBE processing.

Response: **Agree**

Pursuant to the CFR and the Missouri Unified Certification Program, HRD will adopt a timeframe requiring that HRD make decisions on applications for DBE certification within ninety (90) days of receiving all required information from the applicant. However, as a general rule, HRD makes decisions on applications within thirty (30) days of receiving all required information from the applicant.

Prior to the audit, HRD had been providing ample time for firms to submit required documentation. HRD revised its procedures in response to this audit recommendation and will allow the applicant 10 working days for submittal of the information. If the complete information or justification is not received within 10 working days, HRD will issue a final request providing for submission of the information within 5 working days. Failure to submit all of the requested information at the end of the 5 days will result in denial of the firm's application. This conforms to the Missouri Unified Certification Program.

Recommendation 4. The Director of Human Relations should develop written policies and procedures for processing MBE/WBE/DBE applications.

Response: **Agree**

The current policies and procedures are attached as Exhibit 2. They have been updated recently to incorporate the changes recommended by this audit. Each staff person has a copy of the current policies and procedures.

Recommendation 5. The Director of Human Relations should develop a reasonable method of providing goals to departments without requiring departments to physically pick up goals from City Hall.

Response: **Agree**

HRD agrees that multiple methods could be developed to alleviate departments from physically picking up goal requests HRD is working on an internet system and a scanner to be used in conjunction with the pick-up method for departments outside of City Hall.

Recommendation 6 The Director of Human Relations should ensure that the online directory is complete and accurate.

Response: **Agree**

Since HRD has moved to the B2G online Contract Monitoring and Tracking System, the MWDBE directory is now updated daily. Firms with expired certification dates are automatically removed from the directory on their anniversary dates. The only exception is MRCC mandates that a DBE firm must be decertified by MRCC before they can be removed from the directory. Therefore, if a firm is in the process of an appeal and their file has been decertified by HRD, DOT regulations require they are to remain in the directory until MRCC confirms their denial.

Recommendation 7. The Director of Human Relation Division should work with departments to better understand the contracting responsibilities and needs of operating departments; develop written policies and procedures defining the responsibilities of operating departments and HRD during the MBE/WBE contracting process; and offer training on the MBE/WBE program and process through the City's Contract Training Academy.

Response: **Agree**

HRD concurs with the auditor's recommendation that training classes through the Contractor's Training Academy would facilitate better communication, as well as written procedures defining the responsibilities of operating departments during the MWBE goal setting process. HRD will finalize these procedures within the next thirty days.

HRD does value the knowledge and experience that Department staff may possess in regard to the Department's projects. HRD also recognizes the fact that the Department may not possess the same level of knowledge and experience in obtaining MBE/WBE participation on those projects that HRD may possess. Department staff and HRD staff should work together to understand the work involved in the Department's projects and to enhance the possibility of MBE/WBE participation on those projects.

Recommendation 8. The City Manager should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by resolution 060480.

Response: **Agree**

HRD has posted an accumulative participation reports from May 2003 through January 2009. In addition, monthly MWBE reports for various time periods beginning July 2007 are viewable on the HRD's website.

Recommendation 9. The Director of Human Relations Division should collect and report MBE/WBE information as required by ordinance.

Response: **Agree**

Information is posted on HRD's website regarding minority participation in dollars for both primes and subcontractors. Henceforth, HRD shall report MBE/WBE information as provided in the ordinance.

Recommendation 10 The Director of Human Relations Division should perform random audits of a few contracts each year to verify that reported MBE/WBE participation results are accurate. Penalties for intentional misrepresentation should be developed and enforced.

Response: **Agree**

HRD agrees with the Auditor's finding that random audits should be conducted annually to verify the authenticity of the information reported by the general contractors. Initially, the City had no structured monitoring of minority utilization on City projects. **Since September 2006, HRD has requested** contractors to submit monthly Utilization Reports documenting their participation with minority firms. One of the concerns of HRD and MWDBE firms throughout the metropolitan area was that prime contractors were listing them on projects without contacting the minority firms or in many cases failing to obtain actual bid quotes. In some instance, the project would be completed before the minority firm was aware they were included in the initial Contractor's Utilization Plan (CUP).

To address these issues, HRD has developed an on-line contract monitoring and tracking system that allows the subcontractors to verify the dollar amount reported by the prime contractors to the subcontractors. This procedure had been missing from previous contract monitoring. This process helps to eliminate the subcontractor's unawareness of their reported usage, as well as establishing a credible process for the prime, the subcontractor and HRD. Subsequently,

HRD workforce compliance officers have been verifying minority utilization on City projects through on-site observation and interviews.

Furthermore, HRD will consider a process of randomly reviewing a subcontractor's payroll records to strengthen verification of actual utilization.

Recommendation 11. The City Manager should determine when to seek liquidated damages for unmet contractual MBE/WBE commitments.

Response: **Agree**

HRD will codify a policy that seeks liquidated damages. We will also work with the City Attorney to explore all possibilities.

Recommendation 12 The City Manager should develop and adopt a reasonable fee structure for MBE/WBE certifications.

Response: **Agree**

The City Manager and HRD are preparing a proposal for the Mayor and City Council to consider adopting a local certification fee structure.

Recommendation 13. The Director of Human Relations Division should propose to the Missouri Regional Certification Commission that it revise its policies and procedures to permit the adoption of a reasonable fee for the DBE Certification process consistent with the requirements of CFR.

Response: **Agree**

HRD will draft a letter to MRCC proposing a DBE fee assessment for individuals seeking DBE Certification.

Recommendation 14. The Director of Human Relations Division should establish an appropriate customer service atmosphere supported with employee training and annual reviews.

Response: **Agree**

HRD management and staff do not condone inappropriate behavior at pre-bid conferences, public events or any City venue, and has requested specific information regarding these harsh and subjective allegations. HRD disagrees with the Auditor's perception that the department has not established a customer friendly atmosphere and environment for our citizens, fellow employees and staff. In 2006, HRD conducted a customer service survey to determine the quality and

effectiveness of our service (Exhibit 3 – Customer Service Survey Form 2006). In this particular survey seventy-three percent (73%) of the respondents rated our overall service as Satisfied to Very Satisfied; twenty percent (20%) dissatisfied to very dissatisfied, and the remaining six percent (6%) did not provide a comment in either category.

Exhibit B1

Minority and Women Business Enterprise Program
CITY OF FOUNTAINS
HEART OF THE NATION

Human Relations Department

KANSAS CITY
MISSOURI

4th Floor, City Hall
414 East 12th Street
Kansas City, Missouri 64106-2795

(816) 513-1836

Dear Applicant:

The City of Kansas City, Missouri is celebrating 18 years of providing small minority, women and disadvantaged business owners with real and substantial opportunities in City government. In a competitive environment, this particular program allows MWDBE firms opportunities to compete on equal basis for City contracts and purchases. Since May 2003, the City has awarded more than $290 million dollars in construction contracts to minority and women owned firms, and more than $85 million in Professional Service contracts.

Firms seeking certification can attend a Free Pre-Certification Workshop that is held every last Tuesday of the month at 1 p.m. here at City Hall, in the HRD Training room. (When a Holiday falls during the last week of the month this training will be held on the Tuesday prior to the Holiday week.) This workshop is designed to walk applicants through the certification process, as well as explain forms and procedures. Applicants can register by calling 816-513-1810 or online at http://www.kcmo.org/humrel.nsf/web/home.

Another resource tool that is available to our clients is the City's Contracting Guide Information Booklet. This document is intended to provide a clear and concise guide to vendors and companies who have an interest in pursuing contracts with the various departments and entities under the auspices of the City of Kansas City, Missouri. Key departmental contact personnel, what is needed for any company seeking to do business with the City and other information is provided. The intent of assembling all of this information into one clear publication was to provide all interested business concerns a road map, as to how to do business with the City.

We encourage you to look at our program, and attend one of our Free Pre-Certification Workshops for more information and helpful tips.

Sincerely,

Phillip Yelder, Director

CITY OF FOUNTAINS
HEART OF THE NATION

KANSAS CITY
MISSOURI

City of Kansas City Missouri

Human Relations Department

Minority, Women, and Disadvantaged Enterprise Program (MWDBE)

Attend a FREE monthly MWDBE Pre-certification Workshop. These workshops are offered on the last Tuesday of every month at 1:00 p.m., City Hall, 4th floor, HRD Training Room*. For more information or to register, please call 816 513 3610 or visit our website at http://www.kcmo.org/humrel.nsf/web/home

Advantages of Certification:

- Listing in KCMO's MWDBE Directory, which is updated daily and is accessible on the City's website, at http://www.kcmo.org/humrel.nsf/web/home
- Certification accepted by the following entities: Unified Government of Wyandotte County, Mid-American Minority Business Development Council, the KCMO School District, Kansas City Area Transit Authority, Missouri Regional Certification Council (MRCC)
- Access to free workshops, seminars, and training classes
- Regional Electronic notification of contract opportunities, RFPs, and RFQs
- KCMO certification is also accepted by:
  - University of Missouri Systems
  - National Association of Women in Construction (NAWIC)
  - Kansas Department of Transportation
  - Missouri Department of Transportation

Requirements:

The minority or female owner must possess at least 51% ownership, management, and control of the business

- The minority or female owner must have the training/expertise to perform the work, and where required, have a license in his or her name.
- The firm must be independent and currently operating
- Principal place of business must be within the seven county Greater KCMSA (consisting of Cass, Clay, Johnson, Jackson, Platte, Wyandotte, and Leavenworth); and
- The firm maintains full time employees in one or more of the firm's offices within the KCMSA to conduct business or solicit business in the KCMSA the majority of the working time; and
- The firm has transacted business more than once in the KCMSA within the last three years; and
- The firm has been in existence in the KCMSA at least one year prior to application for MBE/WBE program
- Firms are certified for 3 years and must submit annual updates, and notify HRD of any changes in ownership or control.
- The firm must meet the Small Business Administration (SBA) Size Standard(s) for its industry classification(s)
- For DBE certification, applicant must have a Personal Net Worth of less than $750,000, excluding value of home and ownership interest in the business. There are no local presence requirements.

Certification Process:

The certification process includes the following steps:

- Preliminary screening of Application and supporting documentation
- Desk Audit
- Financial Audit
- Field Audit
- Committee Review and Decision

It is very important to submit all supporting documentation promptly to ensure a quick decision. Once all paperwork has been provided and an onsite field audit has been performed, a certification decision should be issued within 30 days.

*When a Holiday falls during the last week of the month, the training will be moved to the Tuesday prior to the Holiday week

CITY OF FOUNTAINS
HEART OF THE NATION

KANSAS CITY
MISSOURI

City of Kansas City Missouri

Human Relations Department

Minority, Women, and Disadvantaged Enterprise Program (MWDBE)

Please make a selection:

_____ I am applying ONLY for certification as a Minority/Women's Business Enterprise (MBE/WBE) under Chapter 38, Sections 84 – 100 of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Kansas City.

Choose one: _____ MBE _____ WBE

Requirements:

- The minority or female owner must possess at least 51% ownership, management, and control of the business
- The minority or female owner must have the training/expertise to perform the work, and where required, have a license in his or her name.
- The firm must be independent and currently operating
- Principal place of business must be within the seven county Greater KCMSA (consisting of Cass, Clay, Johnson, Jackson, Platte, Wyandotte, and Leavenworth); and
- The firm maintains full time employees in one or more of the firm's offices within the KCMSA to conduct business or solicit business in the KCMSA the majority of the working time; and
- The firm has transacted business more than once in the KCMSA within the last three years; and
- The firm has been in existence in the KCMSA at least one year prior to application for MBE/WBE program.
- The firm must meet the Small Business Administration (SBA) Size Standard(s) for its industry classification(s)

omplete the Uniform Certification Application on pages 1 through 8.
o not sign the Affidavit of Certification on pages 9 and 10.
Submit the items on the checklist on page 11 and the list on Appendix A.
Complete and sign the MBE/WBE Affidavit of Certification.

_____ I am applying ONLY for certification as a Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE) under 49 Code of Federal Regulations Part 26.

Requirements:

- The minority or female owner must possess at least 51% ownership, management, and control of the business.
- The minority or female owner must have the training/expertise to perform the work, and where required, have a license in his or her name.
- The firm must be independent and currently operating
- The firm must meet the Small Business Administration (SBA) Size Standard(s) for its industry classification(s)
- Applicant must have a Personal Net Worth of less than $750,000, excluding value of home and ownership interest in the business. There are no local presence requirements.

Complete the Uniform Certification Application on pages 1 through 8.
Sign the Affidavit of Certification on pages 9 and 10.
Submit the items on the checklist on page 11 and the list on Appendix A.
Complete the MRCC Personal Financial Statement.

_____ I am applying for certification BOTH as a Disadvantaged Business Enterprise under 49 Code of Federal Regulation Part 26 AND as a Minority/Women Business Enterprise under Chapter 38, Section 38-84 – 38-100 of the Code of Ordinances of the City of Kansas City.

hoose one: _____ MBE _____ WBE

equirements:

- See requirements listed above for both programs.

Complete the Uniform Certification Application on pages 1 through 8.
Complete and sign the Affidavit of Certification on pages 9 and 10.
Submit the items on the checklist on page 11 and on the list on Appendix A.
Complete the MRCC Personal Financial Statement.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR COMPLETING THE DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE (DBE) PROGRAM UNIFORM CERTIFICATION APPLICATION

NOTE: If you require additional space for any question in this application, please attach additional sheets or copies as needed, taking care to indicate on each attached sheet/copy the section and number of this application to which it refers.

Section 1: CERTIFICATION INFORMATION

A. Prior/Other Certifications

Check the appropriate box indicating for which program your firm is currently certified. If you are already certified as a DBE, indicate in the appropriate box the name of the certifying agency that has previously certified your firm, and also indicate whether your firm has undergone an onsite visit. If your firm has already undergone an onsite visit/review, indicate the most recent date of that review and the state UCP that conducted the review.

NOTE: If your firm is currently certified under the SBA's 8(a) and/or SDB programs, you may not have to complete this application. You should contact your state UCP to find out about a streamlined application process for firms that are already certified under the 8(a) and SDB programs.

B. Prior/Other Applications and Privileges

Indicate whether your firm or any of the persons listed has ever withdrawn an application for a DBE program or an SBA 8(a) or SDB program, or whether any have ever been denied certification, decertified, debarred, suspended, or had bidding privileges denied or restricted by any state or local agency or Federal entity. If your answer is yes, indicate the date of such action, identify the name of the agency, and explain fully the nature of the action in the space provided.

Section 2: GENERAL INFORMATION

A. Contact Information

(1) State the name and title of the person who will serve as your firm's primary contact under this application.
(2) State the legal name of your firm, as indicated in your firm's Articles of Incorporation.
(3) Indicate the primary phone number of your firm.
(4) Indicate a secondary phone number, if any.
(5) Indicate your firm's fax number, if any.
(6) Indicate your firm's or your contact person's email address.
(7) Indicate your firm's website address, if any.
(8) State the street address of your firm (i.e. the physical location of its offices -- not a post office box address).
(9) State the mailing address of your firm, if it is different from your firm's street address.

B. Business Profile

(1) In the box provided, briefly describe the primary business and professional activities in which your firm engages.
(2) Give the Federal Tax ID number of your firm as provided on your firm's filed tax returns, if you have one. This could also be the Social Security number of the owner of your firm.
(3) Give the date on which your firm was officially established, as stated in your firm's Articles of Incorporation.
(4) Give the date on which you and/or each other owner took ownership of the firm.
(5) Check the appropriate box that describes the manner in which you and each other owner acquired ownership of your firm. If you checked "Other," explain in the space provided.
(6) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether your firm is "for profit."
(7) **NOTE:** If you checked "No," then you do NOT qualify for the DBE program and therefore do not need to complete the rest of this application. The DBE program requires all participating firms be for-profit enterprises.
(8) Check the appropriate box that describes the legal form of ownership of your firm, as indicated in your firm's Articles of Incorporation. If you checked "Other," briefly explain in the space provided.
(9) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether your firm has ever existed under different ownership, a different type of ownership, or a different name. If you checked "Yes," specify which and briefly explain the circumstances in the space provided.
(10) Indicate in the spaces provided how many employees your firm has, specifying the number of employees who work on a full-time and part-time basis.

(11) Specify the total gross receipts of your firm for each of the past three years, as declared in your firm's filed tax returns

C. Relationships with Other Businesses

(1) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether your firm is co-located at any of its business locations, or whether your firm shares a telephone number(s), a post office box, any office space, a yard, warehouse, other facilities, any equipment, or any office staff with any other business, organization, or entity of any kind. If you answered "Yes," then specify the name of the other firm(s) and briefly explain the nature of the shared facilities or other items in the space provided.

(2) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether at present, or at any time in the past:

(a) Your firm has been a subsidiary of any other firm;

(b) Your firm consisted of a partnership in which one or more of the partners are other firms;

(c) Your firm has owned any percentage of any other firm; and

(d) Your firm has had any subsidiaries of its own.

(3) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any other firm has ever had an ownership interest in your firm.

(4) If you answered "Yes" to any of the questions in (2)(a)-(d) or (3), identify the name, address and type of business for each.

D. Immediate Family Member Businesses

Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any of your immediate family members own or manage another company. An "immediate family member" is any person who is your father, mother, husband, wife, son, daughter, brother, sister, grandmother, grandfather, grandson, granddaughter, mother-in-law, or father-in-law. If you answered "Yes," provide the name of each relative, your relationship to them, the name of the company they own or manage, the type of business, and whether they own or manage the company.

Section 3: OWNERSHIP

Identify all individuals or holding companies with any ownership interest in your firm, providing the information requested below (if your firm has more than one owner, provide completed copies of this section for each additional owner):

A. Background Information

(1) Give the name of the owner

(2) State his/her title or position within your firm.

(3) Give his/her home phone number.

(4) State his/her home (street) address.

(5) Check the appropriate box that indicates this owner's gender.

(6) Check the appropriate box that indicates this owner's ethnicity (check all that apply). If you checked "Other," specify this owner's ethnic group/identity not otherwise listed.

(7) Check the appropriate box to indicate whether this owner is a U.S. citizen.

(8) If this owner is not a U.S. citizen, check the appropriate box that indicates whether this owner is a lawfully admitted permanent resident. If this owner is neither a U.S. citizen nor a lawfully admitted permanent resident of the U.S., then this owner is NOT eligible for certification as a DBE owner. This, however, does not necessarily disqualify your firm altogether from the DBE program if another owner is a U.S. citizen or lawfully admitted permanent resident and meets the program's other qualifying requirements.

B. Ownership Interest

(1) State the number of years, during which this owner has been an owner of your firm.

(2) Indicate the dollar value of this owner's initial investment to acquire an ownership interest in your firm, broken down by cash, real estate, equipment, and/or other investment.

(3) State the percentage of total ownership control of your firm that this owner possesses.

(4) State the familial relationship of this owner to each other owner of your firm.

(5) Indicate the number, percentage of the total, class, date acquired, and method by which this owner acquired his/her shares of stock in your firm.

Back to Table of Contents

(6) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether this owner performs a management or supervisory function for any other business. If you checked "Yes," state the name of the other business and this owner's title or function held in that business.

(7) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether this owner owns or works for any other firm(s) that has any relationship with your firm. If you checked "Yes," identify the name of the other business and this owner's title or function held in that business. Briefly describe the nature of the business relationship in the space provided.

C. **Disadvantaged Status**

NOTE: You only need to complete this section for each owner that is applying for DBE qualification (i.e. for each owner who is claiming to be "socially and economically disadvantaged" and whose ownership interest is to be counted toward the control and 51% ownership requirements of the DBE program)

(1) Indicate in the space provided the total Personal Net Worth (PNW) of each owner who is applying for DBE qualification. Use the PNW calculator form at the end of this application to compute each owner's PNW.

(2) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any trust has ever been created for the benefit of this disadvantaged owner. If you answered "Yes," briefly explain the nature, history, purpose, and current value of the trust(s).

Section 4: CONTROL

A. **Identify your firm's Officers and Board of Directors:**

(1) In the space provided, state the name, title, date of appointment, ethnicity, and gender of each officer of your firm.

(2) In the space provided, state the name, title, date of appointment, ethnicity, and gender of each individual serving on your firm's Board of Directors.

(3) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any of your firm's officers and/or directors listed above performs a management or supervisory function for any other business. If you answered "Yes," identify each person by name, his/her title, the name of the other business in which s/he is involved, and his/her function performed in that other business.

(4) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any of your firm's officers and/or directors listed above own or work for any other firm(s) that has a relationship with your firm. If you answered "Yes," identify the name of the firm, the officer or director, and the nature of his/her business relationship with that other firm.

B. **Identify your firm's management personnel (by name, title, ethnicity, and gender) who control your firm in the following areas:**

(1) Making of financial decisions on your firm's behalf, including the acquisition of lines of credit, surety bonds, supplies, etc.;

(2) Estimating and bidding, including calculation of cost estimates, bid preparation and submission;

(3) Negotiating and contract execution, including participation in any of your firm's negotiations and executing contracts on your firm's behalf;

(4) Hiring and/or firing of management personnel, including interviewing and conducting performance evaluations;

(5) Field/Production operations supervision, including site supervision, scheduling, project management services, etc.;

(6) Office management;

(7) Marketing and sales;

(8) Purchasing of major equipment;

(9) Signing company checks (for any purpose); and

(10) Conducting any other financial transactions on your firm's behalf not otherwise listed.

(11) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any of the persons listed in (1) through (10) above perform a management or supervisory function for any other business. If you answered "Yes," identify each person by name, his/her title, the name of the other business in which s/he is involved, and his/her function performed in that other business.

(12) Check the appropriate box that indicates whether any of the persons listed in (1) through (10) above own or work for any other firm(s) that has a relationship with your firm. If you answered "Yes," identify the name of the firm, the name

of the person, and the nature of his/her business relationship with that other firm.

C. **Indicate your firm's inventory in the following categories:**

1. **Equipment**
   State the type, make and model, and current dollar value of each piece of equipment held and/or used by your firm. Indicate whether each piece is either owned or leased by your firm.
2. **Vehicles**
   State the type, make and model, and current dollar value of each motor vehicle held and/or used by your firm. Indicate whether each vehicle is either owned or leased by your firm.
3. **Office Space**
   State the street address of each office space held and/or used by your firm. Indicate whether your firm owns or leases the office space and the current dollar value of that property or its lease.
4. **Storage Space**
   State the street address of each storage space held and/or used by your firm. Indicate whether your firm owns or leases the storage space and the current dollar value of that property or its lease.

D. **Does your firm rely on any other firm for management functions or employee payroll?**
Check the appropriate box that indicates whether your firm relies on any other firm for management functions or for employee payroll. If you answered "Yes," briefly explain the nature of that reliance and the extent to which the other firm carries out such functions.

E. **Financial Information**

(1) Banking Information
   (a) State the name of your firm's bank.
   (b) Give the main phone number of your firm's bank branch.
   (c) Give the address of your firm's bank branch.

(2) Bonding Information
   (a) State your firm's Binder Number.
   (b) State the name of your firm's bond agent and/or broker.
   (c) Give your agent's/broker's phone number.
   (d) Give your agent's/broker's address
   (e) State your firm's bonding limits (in dollars), specifying both the Aggregate and Project Limits.

F. **Identify all sources, amounts, and purposes of money loaned to your firm, including the names of persons or firms securing the loan, if other than the listed owner:**
State the name and address of each source, the original dollar amount and the current balance of each loan, and the purpose for which each loan was made to your firm.

G. **List all contributions or transfers of assets to/from your firm and to/from any of its owners over the past two years:**
Indicate in the spaces provided, the type of contribution or asset that was transferred, its current dollar value, the person or firm from whom it was transferred, the person or firm to whom it was transferred, the relationship between the two persons and/or firms, and the date of the transfer.

H. **List current licenses/permits held by any owner or employee of your firm.**
List the name of each person in your firm who holds a professional license or permit, the type of permit or license, the expiration date of the permit or license, and the license/permit number and issuing State of the license or permit.

I. **List the three largest contracts completed by your firm in the past three years, if any.**
List the name of each owner or contractor for each contract, the name and location of the projects under each contract, the type of work performed on each contract, and the dollar value of each contract

J. **List the three largest active jobs on which your firm is currently working.**
For each active job listed, state the name of the prime contractor and the project number, the location, the type of work performed, the project start date, the anticipated completion date, and the dollar value of the contract

K. **AFFIDAVIT & SIGNATURE**
Carefully read the attached affidavit in its entirety. Fill in the required information for

each blank space, and sign and date the affidavit in the presence of a Notary Public, who must then notarize the form

DISADVANTAGED BUSINESS ENTERPRISE PROGRAM
49 C.F.R. PART 26

UNIFORM CERTIFICATION APPLICATION

ROADMAP FOR APPLICANTS

1. **Should I apply?**
   - Is your firm at least 51%-owned by a socially and economically disadvantaged individual(s) who also controls the firm?
   - Is the disadvantaged owner a U.S. citizen or lawfully admitted permanent resident of the U.S.?
   - Is your firm a small business that meets the Small Business Administration's (SBA's) size standard and does not exceed $17.42 million in gross annual receipts?
   - Is your firm organized as a for-profit business?

     ⇒ If you answered "Yes" to all of the questions above, you ***may*** be eligible to participate in the U.S. DOT DBE program.

2. **Is there an easier way to apply?**
   If you are currently certified by the SBA as an 8(a) and/or SDB firm, you may be eligible for a streamlined certification application process. Under this process, the certifying agency to which you are applying will accept your current SBA application package in lieu of requiring you to fill out and submit this form. **NOTE: You must still meet the requirements for the DBE program, including undergoing an on-site review.**

3. **Be sure to attach all of the required documents listed in the Documents Check List at the end of this form with your completed application.**

4. **Where can I find more information?**
   - U.S. DOT – http://osdbuweb.dot.gov/business/dbe/index.html (this site provides useful links to the rules and regulations governing the DBE program, questions and answers, and other pertinent information)
   - SBA – http://www.ntis.gov/naics (provides a listing of NAICS codes) and http://www.sba.gov/size/indextableofsize.html (provides a listing of SIC codes)
   - 49 CFR Part 26 (the rules and regulations governing the DBE program)

Under Sec. 26.107 of 49 CFR Part 26, dated February 2, 1999, if at any time, the Department or a recipient has reason to believe that any person or firm has willfully and knowingly provided incorrect information or made false statements, the Department may initiate suspension or debarment proceedings against the person or firm under 49 CFR Part 29, take enforcement action under 49 CFR Part 31, Program Fraud and Civil Remedies, and/or refer the matter to the Department of Justice for criminal prosecution under 18 U.S.C. 1001, which prohibits false statements in Federal programs.

Section 1: CERTIFICATION INFORMATION

A. Prior/Other Certifications		
Is your firm currently certified for any of the following programs? *(If Yes, check appropriate box(s)*	❑ DBE	Name of certifying agency:
		Has your firm's state UCP conducted an on-site visit? ❑ No ❑ Yes, on ___/___/___ State: _____
	❑ 8(a) ❑ SDB	⊗ **STOP!** If you checked either the 8(a) or SDB box, you ***may not*** have to complete this application. Ask your state UCP about the streamlined application process under the SBA-DOT MOU.

B. Prior/Other Applications and Privileges

Has your firm (under any name) or any of its owners, Board of Directors, officers or management personnel, ever withdrawn an application for any of the programs listed above, or ever been denied certification, decertified, or debarred or suspended or otherwise had bidding privileges denied or restricted by any state or local agency, or Federal entity?

❑ No ❑ Yes, on ___/___/___

If Yes, identify State and name of state, local, or Federal agency and explain the nature of the action:

Section 2: GENERAL INFORMATION

A. Contact Information

(1) Contact person:		(2) Legal name of firm:		
Title:				
(3) Phone #:	(4) Other Phone #:		(5) Fax #:	
(6) E-mail:	(7) Website *(if applicable)*:			
(8) Street address of firm *(No P.O. Box)*:	City:	County/Parish:	State:	Zip:
(9) Mailing address of firm *(if different)*:	City:	County/Parish:	State:	Zip:

B. Business Profile

(1) Describe the primary activities of your firm:	(2) Federal Tax ID (if any):
(3) This firm was established on ___/___/___	(4) I/We have owned this firm since: ___/___/___

(5) Method of acquisition *(check all that apply)*:

❑ Started new business ❑ Merger or consolidation ❑ Other *(explain)*
❑ Bought existing business ❑ Secured concession
❑ Inherited business

(6) Is your firm "for profit"? ❑ No ❑ Yes

⊗ **STOP!** If your firm is ***NOT*** for-profit, then you do NOT qualify for this program and do NOT need to fill out this application.

(7) Type of firm:

- ❑ Sole Proprietorship
- ❑ Partnership
- ❑ Corporation
- ❑ Limited Liability Partnership
- ❑ Limited Liability Corporation
- ❑ Joint Venture
- ❑ Other, Describe:

(8) Has your firm ever existed under different ownership, a different type of ownership, or a different name?	Yes	No
If Yes, explain:		

(9) Number of employees: Full-time Part-time Total

(10) Specify the gross receipts of the firm for the last 3 years:

Year		Total receipts	$
Year		Total receipts	$
Year		Total receipts	$

C. Relationships with Other Businesses

(1) Is your firm co-located at any of its business locations, or does it share a telephone number, P.O. Box, office space, yard, warehouse, facilities, equipment, or office staff, with any other business, organization, or entity? If Yes, identify:	Yes	No

Firm's Name	Nature of shared facilities

(2) At present, or at any time in the past, has your firm:

(a) Been a subsidiary of any other firm?	Yes	No
(b) Consisted of a partnership in which one or more of the partners are other firm(s)?	Yes	No
(c) Owned any percentage of any other firm(s)?	Yes	No
(d) Had any subsidiaries?	Yes	No
(3) Has any other firm had any ownership interest in your firm, at present or at any time in the past?	Yes	No

(4) If you answered "Yes" to any of the questions in (2)(a)-(d) and/or (3), identify the following for each *(attach extra sheets, if needed)*:

Name	Address	Type of Business
1.		
2.		
3.		

D. Immediate Family Member Businesses

Do any of your immediate family members own or manage another company? If Yes, then list *(attach extra sheets, if needed)*:	Yes	No

Name	Relationship	Company	Type of Business	Own or Manage?
1.				
2.				
3.				

Section 3: OWNERSHIP

Identify all individuals or holding companies with any ownership interest in your firm, providing the information requested below *(If more than one owner, attach separate sheets for each additional owner)*:

A. Background Information			
(1) Name:	(2) Title:	(3) Home Phone #:	
(4) Home Address *(street and number)*:	City:	State:	Zip:
(5) Gender:	❑ Female	❑ Male	(6) Ethnic group membership *(Check all that apply)*:
(7) U.S. Citizen:	❑ No	❑ Yes	❑ Black ❑ Native American ❑ Hispanic ❑ Asian Pacific
(8) Lawfully Admitted Permanent Resident:	❑ No	❑ Yes	❑ Other *(specify)* ❑ Subcontinent Asian

B. Ownership Interest		
(1) Number of years as owner:	(2) Initial investment to acquire ownership interest in firm:	
(3) Percentage owned:	Type	Dollar Value
(4) Familial relationship to other owners:	❑ Cash ❑ Real Estate ❑ Equipment ❑ Other	$ $ $ $

(5) Shares of Stock:

Number	Percentage	Class	Date Acquired	Method Acquired

(6) Does this owner perform a management or supervisory function for any other business? If Yes, identify:	❑ No	❑ Yes

Name of Business	Function/Title

(7) Does this owner own or work for any other firm(s) that has a relationship with this firm *(e.g., ownership interest, shared office space, financial investments, equipment, leases, personnel sharing, etc.)*? If Yes, identify:	❑ No	❑ Yes

Name of Business	Function/Title	Nature of Business Relationship

C. Disadvantaged Status		
***NOTE*: Complete this section for each owner applying for DBE qualification (i.e. for each owner claiming to be socially and economically disadvantaged)**		
(1) What is the Personal Net Worth (PNW) of the owner(s) applying for DBE qualification? *(Use and attach the Personal Financial Statement form at the end of this application; attach additional sheets if more than one owner is applying)*		
(2) Has any trust been created for the benefit of this disadvantaged owner(s)?	❑ No	❑ Yes
If Yes, explain *(attach additional sheets if needed)*:		

Section 4: CONTROL

A. Identify your firm's Officers & Board of Directors (If additional space is required, attach a separate sheet):

Name		Title	Date Appointed	Ethnicity	Gender
(1) Officers of the Company	(a)				
	(b)				
	(c)				
	(d)				
	(e)				
(2) Board of Directors	(a)				
	(b)				
	(c)				
	(d)				
	(e)				

(3) Do any of the persons listed in (1) and/or (2) above perform a management or supervisory function for any other business? If Yes, identify for each: ❑ No ❑ Yes

Person	Title	Business	Function

(4) Do any of the persons listed (1) and/or (2) above own or work for any other firm(s) that has a relationship with this firm (*e g, ownership interest, shared office space, financial investments, equipment, leases, personnel sharing, etc.*)? If Yes, identify for each: ❑ No ❑ Yes

Firm Name	Person	Nature of Business Relationship

B. Identify your firm's management personnel who control your firm in the following areas (If more than two persons, attach a separate sheet):

		Name	Title	Ethnicity	Gender
(1) Financial Decisions (*responsibility for acquisition of lines of credit, surety bonding, supplies, etc.*)	a.				
	b.				
(2) Estimating and bidding	a.				
	b.				
(3) Negotiating and Contract Execution	a.				
	b.				
(4) Hiring/firing of management personnel	a.				
	b.				
(5) Field/Production Operations Supervisor	a.				
	b.				
(6) Office management	a.				
	b.				
(7) Marketing/Sales	a.				
	b.				
(8) Purchasing of major equipment	a.				
	b.				
(9) Authorized to Sign Company Checks (for any purpose)	a.				
	b.				
(10) Authorized to make Financial Transactions	a				
	b.				

11) Do any of the persons listed in (1) through (10) above perform a management or supervisory function for any other business? If Yes, identify for each:			❑ No	❑ Yes
Person	Title	Business	Function	

(12) Do any of the persons listed in (1) through (10) above own or work for any other firm(s) that has a relationship with this firm (*e.g., ownership interest, shared office space, financial investments, equipment, leases, personnel sharing, etc.*)? If Yes, identify for each:		❑ No	❑ Yes
Firm Name	Person	Nature of Business Relationship	

C. Indicate your firm's inventory in the following categories (attach additional sheets if needed):

Equipment

Type of Equipment	Make/Model	Current Value	Owned or Leased?
(a)			
(b)			
(c)			

Vehicles

Type of Vehicle	Make/Model	Current Value	Owned or Leased?
(a)			
(b)			
(c)			

Office Space

Street Address	Owned or Leased?	Current Value of Property or Lease
(a)		
(b)		

Storage Space

Street Address	Owned or Leased?	Current Value of Property or Lease
(a)		
(b)		

D. Does your firm rely on any other firm for management functions or employee payroll? If Yes, explain:	❑ No	❑ Yes

E. Financial Information

(1) **Banking Information:**

(a) Name of Bank:	**(b) Telephone Number:**	
(c) Address of Bank:		
City:	**State:**	**Zip Code:**

(2) **Bonding Information:**

If you have bonding capacity, identify:	**(a) Binder No:**	
(b) Name of Agent/Broker:	**(c) Telephone Number:**	
(d) Address of Agent/Broker:		
City:	**State:**	**Zip Code:**
(e) Bonding limit: Aggregate Limit $	Project Limit	$

F. Identify all sources, amounts, and purposes of money loaned to your firm, including the names of any persons or firms securing the loan, if other than the listed owner:

Name of Source	Address Of Source	**Name of Person Securing Loan**	**Original Amount**	**Current Balance**	**Purpose Of Loan**
1.					
2.					
3.					

G. List all contributions or transfers of assets to/from your firm and to/from any of its owners over the past two years (attach additional sheets if needed):

Contribution/Asset	**Dollar Value**	**From Whom Transferred**	**To Whom Transferred**	**Relationship**	**Date of Transfer**
1.					
2.					
3.					

H. List current licenses/permits held by any owner and/or employee of your firm (e.g. contractor, engineer, architect, etc.) (Attach additional sheets if needed):

Name of License/Permit Holder	**Type of License/Permit**	**Expiration Date**	**License Number & State**
1.			
2.			
3.			

I. List the three largest contracts completed by your firm in the past three years, if any:

Name of Owner/Contractor	Name/Location of Project	Type of Work Performed	Dollar Value of Contract
1.			
2.			
3.			

J. List the three largest active jobs on which your firm is currently working:					
Name of Prime Contractor & Project Number	Location of Project	Type of Work	Project Start Date	Anticipated Completion Date	Dollar Value of Contract
1.					
2.					
3.					

Back to Table of Contents

AFFIDAVIT OF CERTIFICATION

This form must be signed and notarized for each owner upon which disadvantaged status is relied.

A MATERIAL OR FALSE STATEMENT OR OMISSION MADE IN CONNECTION WITH THIS APPLICATION IS SUFFICIENT CAUSE FOR DENIAL OF CERTIFICATION, REVOCATION OF A PRIOR APPROVAL, INITIATION OF SUSPENSION OR DEBARMENT PROCEEDINGS, AND MAY SUBJECT THE PERSON AND/OR ENTITY MAKING THE FALSE STATEMENT TO ANY AND ALL CIVIL AND CRIMINAL PEALTIES AVAILABLE PURSUANT TO APPLICABLE FEDERAL AND STATE LAW.

I _____ (full name printed), swear or affirm under penalty of law that I am _____(title) of applicant firm _____ (firm name) and that I have read and understood all of the questions in this application and that all of the foregoing information and statements submitted in this application and its attachments and supporting documents are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, and that all responses to the questions are full and complete, omitting no material information. The responses include all material information necessary to fully and accurately identify and explain the operations, capabilities and pertinent history of the named firm as well as the ownership, control, and affiliations thereof

I recognize that the information submitted in this application is for the purpose of inducing certification approval by a government agency. I understand that a government agency may, by means it deems appropriate, determine the accuracy and truth of the statements in the application, and I authorize such agency to contact any entity named in the application, and the named firm's bonding companies, banking institutions, credit agencies, contractors, clients, and other certifying agencies for the purpose of verifying the information supplied and determining the named firm's eligibility.

I agree to submit to government audit, examination and review of books, records, documents and files, in whatever form they exist, of the named firm and its affiliates, inspection of its places(s) of business and equipment, and to permit interviews of its principals, agents, and employees. I understand that refusal to permit such inquiries shall be grounds for denial of certification.

If awarded a contract or subcontract, I agree to promptly and directly provide the prime contractor, if any, and the Department, recipient agency, or federal funding agency on an ongoing basis, current, complete and accurate information regarding (1) work performed on the project; (2) payments; and (3) proposed changes, if any, to the foregoing arrangements.

I agree to provide written notice to the recipient agency or Unified Certification Program (UCP) of any material change in the information contained in the original application within 30 calendar days of such change (e.g., ownership, address, telephone number, etc.).

I acknowledge and agree that any misrepresentations in this application or in records pertaining to a contract or subcontract will be grounds for terminating any contract or subcontract which may be awarded; denial or revocation of certification; suspension and debarment; and for initiating action under federal and/or state law concerning false statement, fraud or other applicable offenses.

I certify that I am a socially and economically disadvantaged individual who is an owner of the above-referenced firm seeking certification as a Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE). In support of my application, I certify that I am a member of one or more of the following groups, and that I have held myself out as a member of the group(s) (mark all that apply):

- ☐ Female
- ☐ Black American
- ☐ Hispanic American
- ☐ Native American
- ☐ Asian- Pacific American
- ☐ Subcontinent Asian American
- ☐ Other (specify) _____

I certify that I am socially disadvantaged because I have been subjected to racial or ethnic prejudice or cultural bias, or have suffered the effects of discrimination, because of my identity as a member of one or more of the groups identified above, without regard to my individual qualities.

I further certify that my personal net worth does not exceed $750,000, and that I am economically disadvantaged because my ability to compete in the free enterprise system has been impaired due to diminished capital and credit opportunities as compared to others in the same or similar line of business who are not socially and economically disadvantaged.

I declare, under penalty of perjury, that the information provided in this application and supporting documents is true and correct.

*Signature		*Signature	
Printed name		Printed name	
Title		Title	
Date		Date	

***Must be signed by the individual or individuals asserting disadvantaged status.**

NOTARY PUBLIC

On this _____ day of _____ 2 _____ before me appeared _____

and _____ who, being duly sworn, did execute

the fore-going affidavit, and did state they were properly authorized by the above-named DBE firm to execute this affidavit,

and that they did so as their free act and deed.

Signed _____ Notary Public.

My Commission expires:

DBE UNIFORM CERTIFICATION APPLICATION SUPPORTING DOCUMENTS CHECKLIST
In order to complete your application for DBE certification, you must attach copies of all of the following documents as they apply to you and your firm.

All Applicants

- ❑ Work experience resumes (that include places of ownership/employment with corresponding dates), for all owners and officers of your firm
- ❑ Personal Financial Statement (form available with this application)
- ❑ Personal tax returns for the past three years, if applicable, for each owner claiming disadvantaged status
- ❑ Your firm's tax returns (gross receipts) and all related schedules for the past three years
- ❑ Documented proof of contributions used to acquire ownership for each owner (*e.g both sides of cancelled checks*)
- ❑ Your firm's signed loan agreements, security agreements, and bonding forms
- ❑ Descriptions of all real estate (including office/storage space, etc.) owned/leased by your firm and documented proof of ownership/signed leases
- ❑ List of equipment leased and signed lease agreements
- ❑ List of construction equipment and/or vehicles owned and titles/proof of ownership
- ❑ Documented proof of any transfers of assets to/from your firm and/or to/from any of its owners over the past two years
- ❑ Year-end balance sheets and income statements for the past three years (or life of firm, if less than three years); a new business must provide a current balance sheet
- ❑ All relevant licenses, license renewal forms, permits, and haul authority forms
- ❑ DBE and SBA 8(a) or SDB certifications, denials, and/or decertifications, if applicable
- ❑ Bank authorization and signatory cards
- ❑ Schedule of salaries (or other compensation or remuneration) paid to all officers, managers, owners, and/or directors of the firm
- ❑ Trust agreements held by any owner claiming disadvantaged status, if any

Partnership or Joint Venture

- ❑ Original and any amended Partnership or Joint Venture Agreements

Corporation or LLC

- ❑ Official Articles of Incorporation (signed by the state official)
- ❑ Both sides of all corporate stock certificates and your firm's stock transfer ledger
- ❑ Shareholders' Agreement
- ❑ Minutes of all stockholders and board of directors meetings
- ❑ Corporate by-laws and any amendments
- ❑ Corporate bank resolution and bank signature cards
- ❑ Official Certificate of Formation and Operating Agreement with any amendments (for LLCs)

Trucking Company

- ❑ Documented proof of ownership of the company
- ❑ Insurance agreements for each truck owned or operated by your firm
- ❑ Title(s) and registration certificate(s) for each truck owned or operated by your firm
- ❑ List of U.S. DOT numbers for each truck owned or operated by your firm

Regular Dealer

- ❑ Proof of warehouse ownership or lease
- ❑ List of product lines carried
- ❑ List of distribution equipment owned and/or leased

NOTE: The specific state UCP to which you are applying may have additional required documents that you must also supply with your application. Contact the appropriate certifying agency to which you are applying to find out if more is required.

APPENDIX A
ACCEPTABLE EVIDENCE OF MINORITY/WOMAN STATUS

Please submit copies of 2 of the items listed below with your application.

1. Birth Certificate
2. Naturalization Papers
3. Passport
4. Indian tribal, roll tribal, voter registration certificate, or other official documents
5. Driver's licenses
6. School records
7. Medical records
8. Service records
9. Proof of membership and interaction in recognized minority organizations.

In addition to those items listed above, you must submit verification that you are recognized in the particular minority community as a minority. Submit a notarized statement from a bona fide member of the community who is not a relative nor a member of this business. This statement should attest to knowing you as a minority and knowing that you are recognized as such by that minority community. (Because of their special status, proof of Native American status can be accepted only in the form of official documents).

CERTIFICATION AFFIDAVIT

State of _____)
) ss.
County of _____)

We, the undersigned officers of the afore-mentioned firm agree to the following conditions:

To abide by all of the rules and regulations governing the certification process hereafter

(Note: If, after filing this application, and prior to the expiration of your certification, there is any change in the ownership and/or management of this firm, you must notify the Kansas City, MO Human Relations Department in writing within thirty days after the change. Failure to comply with this requirement may lead to a loss of certification.)

I _____ am seeking certification as a Disadvantaged/Minority and/or Woman Owned Business Enterprise with the Kansas City, Missouri Human Relations Department. By this affidavit I affirm that I believe I have suffered from past race and/or gender discrimination in the City of Kansas City, in the trade and industry which is my business.

The department has the right to conduct an on-site review of the firm's operations, as well as audit and examine the company's books and review contracts, company structure, facilities and to request whatever additional information it deems necessary from time to time, in order to monitor the status of the company, if the firm is certified by the department as a bona-fide MBE/WBE and/or DBE.

Furthermore, the undersigned, swear under oath, the foregoing statements and application contents are true and complete, and include all material and information necessary to identify the firm as a MBE/WBE and/or DBE with the Kansas City MO Human Relations Department as well as identifying all current owners, directors, officers or members of the firm.

That the department may deny or rescind certification after applying its own procedures if, during or after the certification process it finds that the undersigned have submitted false, inaccurate, or misleading information.

Any material omission or misrepresentation will be grounds for terminating the eligibility of this firm as a certified or qualified MBE/WBE and/or DBE, as well as any contract which may have been awarded upon those programs, and for initiating action under City and/or Missouri civil and/or criminal laws concerning false affidavits, false statements or declarations, perjury, fraud, stealing by deceit, or other applicable offenses. (Making a false affidavit is a misdemeanor. See Section 575.050, RsMo 1986.)

*Signature		*Signature	
Printed Name		Printed Name	
Title		Title	
Date		Date	

*Must be signed by at least one officer if a Corporation; one disadvantaged partner if a Partnership; or the proprietor if a Sole Proprietorship.

NOTARY PUBLIC

On this _____ day of _____, 20 ____, before me appeared _____ and _____ who, being duly sworn, did execute the foregoing affidavit, and did state they were properly authorized by the above-named MBE/WBE and/or DBE firm to execute this affidavit, and that they did so as their free act and deed.

Missouri Regional Certification Committee
Disadvantaged Business Enterprise

Personal Financial Statement

Complete this form for: each disadvantaged proprietor, or (2) each limited partner who owns 51% or more interest and each general partner, or (3) each stockholder owning 51% or more of voting stock, or (4) any person or entity providing a guaranty on the loan.

Name		Business Phone	
Residence Address		Residence Phone	
City, State and Zip Code			
Name of Business			

ASSETS	(Omit Cents)	LIABILITIES	(Omit Cents)
Cash on hand and in bank(s)	$	Accounts Payable	$
Savings Accounts	$	Notes Payable to Banks and Others:	$ (Describe in Section 2)
IRA or Other Retirement Accounts	$	Installment Account (Auto) Monthly Payments	$ $
Accounts & Notes Receivable	$	Installment Account (Other) Monthly Payments	$ $
Life Insurance-Cash Surrender Value Only	$ (Complete Section 8)	Loan on Life Insurance	$
Stocks and Bonds	$ (Describe in Section 3)	Mortgages on Real Estate	$ (Describe in Section 4)
Real Estate	$ (Describe in Section 4)	Unpaid Taxes	$ (Describe in Section 6)
Automobile(s)-Present Value	$	Other Liabilities	$ (Describe in Section 7)
Other Personal Property (RV's, boats, household goods, jewelry, art, etc.)	$ (Describe in Section 5)		
Other Assets	$ (Describe in Section 5)		
Total Assets	$	**Total Liabilities**	$
		TOTAL NET WORTH (Assets – Liabilities)	$

Section 1. Source of Income		Contingent Liabilities	
Salary	$	As Endorser or Co-Maker	$
Net Investment Income	$	Legal Claims and Judgments	$
Real Estate Income	$	Provision for Federal Income Tax	$
Other Income (Describe below)	$	Other Special Debt	$

Description of Other Income in Section 1.

Section 2. Notes Payable to Bank and Others. (Use attachments if necessary. Each attachment must be identified as a part of this statement and signed.)

Name and Address of Noteholder(s)	Original Balance	Current Balance	Payment Amount	Frequency (monthly, etc.)	How Secured or Endorsed Type of Collateral

Section 3. Stocks and Bonds. (Use attachment if necessary. Each attachment must be identified as a part of this PNW Statement and must be signed.)

Number of Shares	Name of Securities	Cost	Market Value Quotation/ Exchange	Date of Quotation/ Exchange	Total Value

Section 4. Real Estate Owned. (List each parcel separately. Use attachments if necessary. Each attachment must be identified as a part of this PNW Statement and must be signed.)

	Property A	Property B	Property C
Type of Property			
Address			
Date Purchased			
Original Cost			
Present Market Value			
Name & Address of Mortgage Holder			
Mortgage Account Number			
Mortgage Balance			
Amount of Payment Per Month/Year (Specify)			
Status of Mortgage			

Section 5. Other Personal Property and Other Assets. (Describe, and if any is pledged as security, state name and address of lien holder, amount of lien, Terms of payment, and if delinquent, describe delinquency)

Section 6. Unpaid Taxes. (Describe in detail, as to type, to whom payable, when due, amount, and to what property, if any, a tax lien attaches)

Section 7. Other Liabilities. (Describe in detail)

Section 8. Life Insurance Held.
(Give face amount and cash surrender value of policies - name of insurance company and beneficiaries)

I hear by certify that no assets have been transferred to any beneficiary for less than fair market value in the last two years. I authorize the Missouri Regional Certification Committee (MRCC) to verify the accuracy of the statements made in order to determine whether I meet the standards of economic disadvantage for participation in the DBE Program in the MRCC. These statements are true and correct to the best of my belief.

Signature	Date	Social Security Number
Signature	Date	Social Security Number

State of _____ Notary Public _____
County of _____ Commission expires: _____

(Seal)

On this _____ of, _____, 20_____.

Signed, _____, Notary Public

My Commission expires: _____

Section 1 - Applications

1.1 Applications

Applications are stored at front desk to give to walk ins, they are also provided on line through the website. The application requests all information needed to determine eligibility for certification plus supporting documentation.

Packet includes

- Cover letter and description of program
- Application - UCP
- Affidavit of Certification – applicant affirms that she/he has suffered discrimination, agrees to on-site review, and swears that all information provided is true
- Document Request Checklist
- Appendix A – Acceptable Evidence of Minority/Woman Status
- Statement of Personal Net Worth
- Personal Financial Statement

1.2 Applicants are those who turn in **applications**. Applications are date stamped at the front desk.

Applicants are requested to provide the following with their application:

- Work experience resumes for all owners and officers of firm
- Personal tax returns for past three years
- Firm's tax returns
- Documented proof of contributions used to acquire ownership for each owner
- Signed loan agreements, security agreements, and bonding forms
- Descriptions of all real estate owned/leased by firm and documented proof of ownership/signed leases
- List of equipment leased and signed lease agreements
- List of construction equipment and/or vehicles owned and titles/proof of ownership
- Documented proof of any transfers of assets to/from your firm and/or to/from any of its owners over the past two years
- Year-end balance sheets and income statements for the past three years
- All relevant licenses, license renewal forms, permits and haul authority forms
- DBE and SBA 8(a) or SDB certifications, denials, and/or de-certifications, if applicable
- Bank authorization and signatory cards
- Schedule of salaries paid to all officers, managers, owners, and/or directors of the firm
- Trust agreements if any

- Documents of partnership or incorporation

All applicants must complete and submit an appropriate application form. Each applicant must attest to the accuracy and truthfulness of the information on the application form.

1.3 Procedure for accepting applications and opening files

Applications will not be accepted unless they contain adequate supporting documents. Applications will be reviewed by the intake person. If application is insufficient, intake person will send letter giving applicant 15 working days to submit supporting documents. Letter will advise applicant that if the documents are not submitted within the time limit, the application will not be accepted and a file will not be opened.

If applicant submits the requested information, intake person will give application to Diane who will open a file and assign the case to a CCO.

If applicant does not submit the requested information within 15 working days, the applicant will be advised in writing that the application was insufficient for processing and she/he will need to reapply in order to be evaluated for eligibility for certification. Unsuccessful applicants will be advised in writing that she/he should attend pre-certification workshop before reapplying.

Intake person will keep applications and supporting documentation in manila file in central filing cabinet. Intake person will maintain a database of incoming applications with the date the application was first received at HRD, the date of the 15 day letter, and the date it was complete and assigned.

Applications that are not complete and have been closed out for failure to provide information will be filed in the collapsing filing cabinets system in a clearly marked space.

Forms:
Application
Certification Application Affidavit
Appendix A Acceptable Evidence of Minority/Woman Status
Statement of Personal Net Worth
Personal Financial Statement
Application 15 day letter

Section 2 File Management

2.1 Files – Intake person reviews application and places each application in a file. File is organized according to a **Documents Organization Sheet for Certification Files**. A **File Correspondence sheet** is attached to the first left section of the file. Forms are tabbed across the bottom for identification.

Intake person enters firm information into B2G system and Certification Master File. A file is opened on the server in the applicant business's name in the applications shared file on the MWDBE server. She assigns the file to a CCO. The CCO's name is printed on the upper right hand corner of the outside cover of the file. New applications will be marked as "New" with the date it was assigned. Files are assigned on a rotating basis.

2.2 Opening Letter – Upon receiving the file, the CCO immediately sends an **opening letter** to the applicant advising the applicant that she/he is the CCO and will be working with the company to determine eligibility for certification.

Forms:
Documents Organization Sheet for Certification Files
D/M/WBE File Correspondence
Opening Letter

Section 3 Audits

3.1 Desk Audit - CCO reviews file to determine whether application contains supporting documentation. If not, see Section 4.

3.2 On-site interview – Once the CCO has the required and requested information from the applicant, the CCO schedules an on-site visit to the business. The CCO completes a **Questionnaire** with the applicant and tours the business and property. The CCO views the equipment necessary to perform the work. If necessary, the CCO requests additional supporting documentation using procedure in Section 4.

3.3 Analysis – The CCO reviews the file with the application, the supporting documentation, and on-site questionnaire and analyzes eligibility for certification. All the applicant's submissions are reviewed for internal consistency, accuracy, and conformity with the eligibility standards. Each element of either the local ordinance or the federal regulation is analyzed. The CCO prepares a **DMWBE Certification File Review Report** which includes portions of the relevant law and an analysis of the facts.

During the desk audit, the CCO will perform the following tasks:

- Analyze the ownership of stock, partnership agreements, and/or operating agreements in the firm, as well as any other documents related to organizational structure.
- Analyze the bonding and financial capacity of the firm
- Determine the work history of the firm, including contracts received, and work completed.
- Determine the type of work for which the firm will receive participation credit.
- Verify the firm's preferred locations for performing the work

Forms:
On-site Review Questionnaire
DMWBE Certification File Review Report

Section 4 10 day letter and 5 day letter

If there is insufficient evidence in the file upon which to base a decision, the CCO shall request additional information. No action will be taken on an application until all items have been submitted. Applicants who fail or refuse to submit information deemed necessary for certification review will not be certified. If any information requested is not available or applicable, the applicant must provide a written explanation.

The CCO will notify the applicant of the information necessary and will give 10 working days for submittal of the information, or a reasonable justification for delay. The CCO will use the 10 day letter and fill in the information that needs to be submitted.

The CCO will note in the comments section of the vendors certification file on B2G that a 10 day letter was sent and the information requested. The CCO will select "Comment with due date" and enter the 15th day. The CCO will check the alert box. This will trigger an e-mail to the CCO on the 15th day from the date of the letter to remind the CCO to pull the file and check to see if the information was received.

If the information or justification is not received within 10 working days, the CO will issue a final request by certified mail, e-mail, or fax using the 5 day letter form. The final request will provide for submission of the information within 5 working days. Failure to submit the requested information at the end of the 5 days will result in denial of the firm's application.

The CCO will note in the comments section of the vendors certification file on B2G that a 5 day letter was sent and the information requested. The CCO will select "Comment with due date" and enter the 10th day from the date of the letter. The CCO will check the alert box. This will trigger an e-mail to the CCO on the 10th day from the date of the letter to remind the CCO to pull the file and check to see if the information was received.

Forms:
10 day letter
5 day letter

Section 5 Decisions on New Applications

5.1 Approval – CCO places prepared DMWBE Certification File Review Report in file and places file in Manager's office for review. Manager reviews, initials and dates Report and passes it to Director. Director reviews and decides if business is eligible for certification. If so, Director initials and dates Report and gives file back to CCO to issue Approval Letter(s) and Certificate(s). There will be separate letters and certificates for MWBE and DBE.

5.2 Denial – CCO places prepared DMWBE Certification File Review Report in file and places file in Manager's office for review. Manager reviews, initials and dates Report and passes it to Director. Director reviews and decides if business should be denied. If so, Director initials and dates Report and gives file back to CCO to issue Denial Letter(s).

Denial letters will contain an explanation of the reasons, specifically referencing the evidence in the record that supports each reason. There will be separate denial letters for MWBE and DBE.

Denial letter will state that the firm shall be ineligible to reapply for MBE/WBE certification for one year from the date of the denial or the date of the final appeal decision, whichever is later. DBE denial letter shall state that the firm shall be ineligible to reapply for DBE for one year from the date of the denial.

Denial letter will state appeal rights as described in Section 5.4, 5.5, and 5.6.

5.3 Entries into B2G – After decision has been made and letters go out, file goes to Diane to enter into the system.

5.4 Appeal rights for new applications for MBE/WBE -

a. **If City denies certification for failure to submit required documentation, show real and substantial presence, or exceeded business size standards**, denial letter will advise firm that there is no reconsideration of the decision.

b. **If denial is not for failure to submit required documentation, show presence, or size**, denial letter will state that firm may appeal decision by filing a written notice of appeal within 20 business days. Denial letter will inform firm that written notice of appeal must state the reason(s) for the appeal and include all supporting documentation.

Information or documentation is limited to the issue(s) raised in written notice of appeal. No new or additional documentation shall be considered for the appeal without a showing by the firm that is was not available. The written notice must specify whether the firm wishes to appeal in writing and/or appear personally for a hearing and if they intend to be accompanied by a lawyer.

5.5 Appeal rights for new applications for DBE –

a. **If firm is denied due to failing to submit required documentation or due to exceeding the Personal Net Worth cap**, it is not appealable.

b. **Firms denied DBE for any other reason** must appeal the decision directly to the U.S. Department of Transportation within 90 days of the final decision at:

U.S. Department of Transportation
Office of Civil Rights
1200 New Jersey Avenue, S.E. W-35
Washington D.C. 20590

The grounds of the appeal are limited to the issues raised in the denial letter, and any new information submitted must be specifically in support of the applicant firm's appeal.

5.6 Appeal rights for new applications for WMBE and DBE –

Firm may be certified if the reason(s) for denial is solely for MBE/WBE certification criteria equivalent to the DBE certification and they successfully appeal their DBE certification and otherwise fulfill the requirements for MBE/WBE certification.

Forms:
Approval Letter
Certificate
Denial Letter

Section 6 Annual Reviews

6.1 **MBE/WBE** – Ordinance requires yearly updates of information including but not limited to current licenses and business and personal tax returns. Tax returns must include federal, state, and local returns and schedules and all attachments.

6.2 **DBE** – Every year on anniversary date of certification, DBE must provide affidavit affirming that there have been no changes in the firm's circumstances affecting its ability to meet size, disadvantaged status, ownership, or control requirements or material changes in information provided on application. Affidavit shall specifically affirm that firm continues to met SBA business size criteria and overall gross receipts cap. Firm must provide supporting documentation of size and gross receipts.

6.3 **Procedure** – Diane provides two annual forms with initial certificate. She sends out Annual Packet with Annual Review Form 60 days prior to anniversary date.

6.4 **Failure to cooperate** – If firm fails to respond to CCO's request for documentation, CCO shall use 10 day and 5 day letter procedure in Section 4. Failure to cooperate is grounds for decertification.

Forms:
Annual Review Form

Section 7 Renewals

6.2 Each business must be re-certified within 3 years of the initial certificate or the certificate expires. MBE/WBE certificates automatically expire if not renewed but DBE's must be de-certified through the MRCC.

6.3 Diane notes when re-certifications are due and sends out a **Re-certification packet** to the business. Packet is sent out at least 60 days prior to the expiration of the certificate. When packet is returned, she assigns it to a C.O. on a rotating basis. Business must provide documentation to support recertification application. If not, see Section 4.

6.4 Recertification follows the same procedure as initial application, see Sec 1.

6.5 **Approval** – CCO places prepared DMWBE Certification File Review Report in file and places file in Manager's office for review. Manager reviews, initials and dates Report and passes it to Director. Director reviews and decides if business is eligible for certification. If so, Director initials and dates Report and gives file back to CCO to issue Approval Letter(s) and Certificate(s). There will be separate letters and certificates for MWBE and DBE.

6.6 **Denial** – CCO places prepared DMWBE Certification File Review Report in file and places file in Manager's office for review. Denial is evaluated in weekly staff meeting. Manager reviews, initials and dates Report and passes it to Director. Director reviews and decides if business should be denied. If so, Director initials and dates Report and gives file back to CCO to issue Denial Letter(s).

Denial letters will contain an explanation of the reasons, specifically referencing the evidence in the record that supports each reason. There will be separate denial letters for MWBE and DBE.

Denial letter will state that the firm shall be ineligible to reapply for MBE/WBE certification for one year from the date of the denial or the date of the final appeal decision, whichever is later. DBE denial letter shall state that the firm shall be ineligible to reapply for DBE for one year from the date of the denial.

Denial letter will state appeal rights as described in Section 6.7.

6.7 **Appeal rights for Denial of Renewal of MBE/WBE**

a. **In circumstances where a certified firm has failed to submit required documentation, failed to demonstrate real and substantial presence, or exceeded size standards**, no appeal rights.

b. **If denial is not for failure to submit required documentation, show presence, or size**, denial letter will state that firm may appeal decision by filing a written notice of appeal within 20 business days. Denial letter will inform firm that written notice of appeal must state the reason(s) for the appeal and include all supporting documentation. Information or documentation is limited to the issue(s) raised in written notice of appeal. No new or additional documentation shall be considered for the appeal without a showing by the firm that is was not available. The written notice must specify whether the firm wishes to appeal in writing and/or appear personally for a hearing and if they intend to be accompanied by a lawyer.

6.8 Appeal rights for Denial of Recertification of DBE

a. **If certified firm failed to submit required documentation including annual update or exceeded Personal Net Worth thresholds**, it is not appealable.

b. **For other denials of recertification**, firm can only appeal to the MRCC by making a written request within 15 calendar days of decision. Letter must specify whether it wishes to appeal in writing or appear personally. MRCC will notify appellant of date of hearing.

Forms:
Re-certification application

1. Describe the quality of customer service you received during your most recent encounter with the Human Relations Department?

answered question	**78**
skipped question	**1**

	Response Percent	Response Count
Excellent	**38.5%**	**30**
Satisfactory	32.1%	25
Unsatisfactory	15.4%	12
view Other (please specify)	14.1%	11

2. How long did you have to wait before speaking to a HRD staff member?

answered question	**76**
skipped question	**3**

	Response Percent	Response Count
I was taken care of immediately	**28.9%**	**22**
Within 3 minutes	23.7%	18
3-5 minutes	9.2%	7
5-10 minutes	14.5%	11
More than 10 minutes	6.6%	5

2. How long did you have to wait before speaking to a HRD staff member?

view Other (please specify)	17.1%	13

3. What would best describe your experience when calling the HRD?

answered question	**76**
skipped question	**3**

	Response Percent	Response Count
Excellent	26.3%	20
Good	**43.4%**	**33**
Kept on hold	3.9%	3
Had to explain several times	9.2%	7
Transferred several times	3.9%	3
view Other (please specify)	13.2%	10

4. The HRD Staff was:

answered question	**75**
skipped question	**4**

	Yes	No	N/A	Response

4. The HRD Staff was:

				Count
Friendly and Courteous	**83.3% (60)**	11.1% (8)	5.6% (4)	72
Excellent Job	**69.7% (46)**	21.2% (14)	9.1% (6)	66
Knowledgeable	**76.1% (54)**	18.3% (13)	5.6% (4)	71
Fast and Efficient	**66.7% (46)**	27.5% (19)	5.8% (4)	69
Professional	**79.1% (53)**	16.4% (11)	4.5% (3)	67

5. Which qualities of the HRD Staff was exceptional?

answered question	**75**
skipped question	**4**

	Response Percent	Response Count
Patient	0.0%	0
Enthusiastic	4.0%	3
Listen carefully	17.3%	13
Friendly	26.7%	20
Responsive	**29.3%**	**22**
None of the Above	13.3%	10
view Other (please	9.3%	7

5. Which qualities of the HRD Staff was exceptional?

specify)

6. How helpful was the information from the Human Relations Department staff?

answered question	**75**
skipped question	**4**

	Response Percent	Response Count
Excellent	32.0%	24
Good	**44.0%**	**33**
Poor	10.7%	8
I was given the wrong formation	2.7%	2
He/She did not understand the question	2.7%	2
view Other (please specify)	8.0%	6

7. How long did it take to get your issue resolved?

answered question	**76**
skipped question	**3**

	Response Percent	Response Count

7. How long did it take to get your issue resolved?

mmediate resolution	19.7%	15
1-3 days	**25.0%**	**19**
1-5 days	2.6%	2
More than a week	21.1%	16
The problem is still unresolved	10.5%	8
view Other (please specify)	21.1%	16

8. How would you describe the process of getting your concerns resolved?

answered question	**75**
skipped question	**4**

	Response Percent	Response Count
Excellent	29.3%	22
Satisfactory	**41.3%**	**31**
Unsatisfactory	17.3%	13
view Other (please specify)	12.0%	9

9. If the service was unsatisfactory, please indicate what happened.

9. If the service was unsatisfactory, please indicate what happened.

answered question	15
skipped question	64

	Response Count
view	15

10. Overall, how satisfied are you with the service(s) provided by the Human Relations Department?

answered question	78
skipped question	1

	Response Percent	Response Count
Very Satisfied	**37.2%**	**29**
Satisfied	28.2%	22
Somewhat Satisfied	7.7%	6
Dissatisfied	15.4%	12
Very Dissatisfied	5.1%	4
view Other (please specify)	6.4%	5

11. What can we do to improve our Customer Service?

answered question	36

11. What can we do to improve our Customer Service?

skipped question	**43**

	Response Count
view	36

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 11 of 11 responses

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	Customer service has ranged from satisfactory to unsatisfactory, never excellent. The biggest probelem is getting a call back or semi-immediate help, but once the ball gets rolling it's satisfactory.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2.	When Mr. Yelder ask me to send my resume, I did. But I never hear a word from Mr. Yelder.	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
3.	Much better than a year ago. More customer service oriented!!!! Was really bad about 1-2 years ago	Mon, 3/13/06 7:25 AM
4.	I have had no direct contact with the customer service department so have no opinion.	Sun, 3/12/06 10:43 AM
5.	I don't recall calling your department, but I guess the lady that I spoke with may have been from your department, although I thought it was purchasing. I would like to discuss my past experinece with your department though. It has been a couple of years, but it has happened on another occasion.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
6.	Have a hard time getting information. Responses are not customer friendly. I feel as if I inconvenience the staff when calling for information.	Tue, 3/7/06 8:09 PM
7.	It has been a few years since I have had any need of service from HRD. I have found in the past, the staff has been very good.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:32 AM
8.	I haven't had any contact lately.	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
9.	I felt a bias in the way I was treated because I am a minority other than African American. Other minority groups on your staff are either under represented or not represented at all.	Mon, 3/6/06 11:52 AM
10.	Excellent: Ms. Ester Moten assisted with my WBE certification..this is the first time in 20 years of certification someone actually came to my office.It was a very enjoyable meeting. Ester went out of her way to work with several quetion I had.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:55 AM
11.	We have had no contact with tis dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 13 of 13 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	Other than the person answering the phone I can't remember ever getting immediate help. It's usually a call back but the return phone calls have gotten quicker according to who or what the call is regarding.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2.	I have not called the HRD department recently. In the past everyone has always been quick to respond.	Wed, 3/15/06 6:36 AM
3.	I don't remember how long it took to talk to someone.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:07 AM
4.	left message to call me back	Thu, 3/9/06 7:23 AM
5.	I don't recall.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
6.	It is usually several days.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
7.	don't remember	Tue, 3/7/06 6:32 AM
8.	I was called back.	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
9.	see 1	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
10.	We had an appointment in our office. Your agent was prompt.	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
11.	no caontac twith this dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM
12.	Did not return my call. I had to call a second time to talk with her.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:08 AM
13.	A few days before returned message through voice or email.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:38 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 10 of 10 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	It's usually a transfer to voice mail.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2.	I have not called the HRD department lately, but in the past everyone has always been very helpful and nice to work with.	Wed, 3/15/06 6:36 AM
3.	Will call switchboard and ask specifically for person i'm seeking. history of calling hrd not good	Tue, 3/14/06 10:56 AM
4.	Nobody seems to know who is in charge	Tue, 3/14/06 7:57 AM
5.	This issue could not be resolved with a phone call.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:07 AM
6.	I would be placed on hold and transferred from one person to another, having to re-explain my situation over and over.	Thu, 3/9/06 9:22 AM
7.	I spoke with the rep about getting my commodity codes input correctly since I was not receiving any bid notifications at all. He helped me update them, but I still haven't received any in about 3 years. Something is wrong. I gave up calling in to get it fixed.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
8.	I have to leave a message. Some times I get a call right back most of the time it is a day or so later if at all. They all always very curteous and helpful when I do speek to them. I think they just have to much to do.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
9.	In the past, calls were transferred to different people. Therefore, I don't call any more	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
10.	no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 7 of 7 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	I don't intend to be harsh or critical. I'm sure employees do what they were required but no one seems to be able to help you outside of the person who is handling your file. No one knows anything about anything outside of their own area. They are rarely patient or enthusiastic. It's according to who answers the phone that day. Once you speak with the person you need or have built a relationship with they are typically patient and responsive.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2.	Sharon Goodloe demonstrated all of the above. She exemplified the epitome of exceptional customer service.	Tue, 3/14/06 8:12 PM
3.	When I did finally get with my contact she has always tried to be helpful and responsive. It seems she is spread to thin.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
4.	Some of the staff can be the above qualities, but overall the customer service is below average.	Tue, 3/7/06 8:09 PM
5.	Varies from staff member to staff member. Some are somewhat helpful while others are almost hostile.	Mon, 3/6/06 11:52 AM
6.	All of the above	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
7.	no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 6 of 6 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

Comment Text	Response Date
1. There is no one answer to that question. The left hand never knows what the right hand is doing so you have to be talking to the person who is handling the particular area of interest.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2. Once I am able to get someone who can give me information, I am usually able to take the information and resolve my issue--sometimes not.	Thu, 3/9/06 9:22 AM
3. It didn't work. I am a regiatered vendor and get absolutely no bid opportunities. I know there is a service, but I don't think I should have to pay. Even so, I should still be notified of opportunities unless that's not how it works. No one has told me that.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
4. I was told that there could possibly be some MBE participation on a contract but my calls were never returned.	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
5. I have not called upon the HR Dept lately.	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
6. no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 16 of 16 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	I rarely have a need but when I do it's typically at least a week to get it resolved, but it does get resolved which is most important.	Wed, 3/15/06 9:12 AM
2.	I have not had an issue to be resolved.	Wed, 3/15/06 6:36 AM
3.	9 months	Tue, 3/14/06 7:07 AM
4.	It was resolved by a different group, but Mr. Yelder was able to put my query through to the right one without me having to recontact and without delay.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:05 AM
5.	Never receive a response about my email of resume.	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
6.	Never.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
7.	Months	Tue, 3/7/06 10:06 AM
8.	I have not called upon the HR Dept lately.	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
9.	Application for WBE Status - so the timeframe required was More than a week but it was to be expected.	Mon, 3/6/06 1:32 PM
10.	No problem	Mon, 3/6/06 9:14 AM
11.	No issues to resolve	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
12.	no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM
13.	This was regarding certification and this takes time.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:37 AM
14.	When I spoke with the HRD staff member about Peoplesoft problem when I submitted my resume, she was unsympathetic	Mon, 3/6/06 7:08 AM
15.	No real issue needed resolution just answer to general questions.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:38 AM
16.	The issue is still in the works, but it is very current and I am sure it will be resolved in a timely manner.	Thu, 2/23/06 11:55 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 9 of 9 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1	no comment	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
2	slow.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
3	I guess the best way to summarize my experience is that I don't expect much, expect it to take longer than I would hope for and that it is usually done as if I am being an inconvenience.	Tue, 3/7/06 8:09 PM
4	The office of the city manager is working with me to get the issue resolved.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:02 AM
5	proess?	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
6	I have not called upon the HR Dept lately	Mon, 3/6/06 4:44 PM
7	Not applicable	Mon, 3/6/06 1:32 PM
8	We had no concerns. However, we did have a very positive discussion with the staff about several issues. The staff appeared to be very committed and knowledgable.	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
9	no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 15 of 15 responses

1.	Certification completion process is still unresolved	Wed, 3/15/06 8:49 AM
2.	Each staff member interprets the regs in a different way. It is as if there is no standard.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:57 AM
3.	It took 9 months to get my certification as a Woman Owned Business.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:07 AM
4.	no comment	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
5.	I explained above.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM
6.	Two fold problem: very untimely responses (I had to constantly track down staff) and fundamental ignorance about the business operations they were allegedly evalutating.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:34 AM
7.	Employee did not listen to comprehend the necessary action but continued to discuss her work load problems.	Tue, 3/7/06 10:06 AM
8.	Can never receive information on time.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:33 AM
9.	The process for WBE certification has been lengthy and has been a series of requests for added information. It has disrupted my work and has been frustrating because the paperwork requested is not necessary to determine the status of the business ownership. The ownership is clear in all of the previous papers.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:02 AM
10.	No returned phone calls, and as for as I know there was no MBE goal added to the contract.	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
11.	Slow handling certifications.	Mon, 3/6/06 1:24 PM
12.	Each staff member seems to have the authority to interpret the regulations in a manner that reflects personal opinion. There is NO CONSISTENCY in the application of policy.	Mon, 3/6/06 11:52 AM
13.	N/A	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
14.	I was qualified for a position. When I submitted the required information I encounter problems with the Peoplesoft application. I received a rejection letter from the City that indicated I did not complete the required information. I tried to discuss this with a HRD staff person. I even asked Alvin Brooks' assistant to help contact the HR staff person, the HR staff person did not respond to Alvin Brooks assistant. When I spoke to the HR staff person she was not sympathetic to my issues and did not offer any help to remedy the problem.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:08 AM
15.	General, the HRD staff is able to answer my question immediately. It did take 3-4 months to get my office visit aftr I applied. I was under the impression this was due to short staffing - however this was in summer of 2003. Since then, I have had interaction with Esther and Brian and they have always been very helpful and especially knowledgable. I am have some interactions with Ollie - he seems pleasant but not as educated to the process as Esther and Brian seem to be.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:42 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 5 of 5 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

Comment Text	Response Date
1. no comment	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
2. I have not delt enough with them to answer this question yet. It just took a long time for us to get certified.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
3. Some listening on your behalf but I can't cash conversation.	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
4. NO CONTACT SINCE LAST SUMMER WHEN WE WERE RECERTIFIED AS D/WBE. WE THOUGHT THIS PROCESS TOOK TOO LONG.	Mon, 3/6/06 11:12 AM
5. no contact with the dept.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:40 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

Displaying 1 - 36 of 36 responses << Prev Next >> **Jump To:** 1 Go >>

	Comment Text	Response Date
1.	Training	Wed, 3/15/06 8:49 AM
2.	Continue your present service	Tue, 3/14/06 1:19 PM
3.	MBE/DBE Notification is the only concern that I have. When Prime's list me as a sub, I would like to know it before the project is ready to be executed. This would allow me to schedule it 100% better. Other than that HR is very helpful and provide an execellent service.	Tue, 3/14/06 11:44 AM
4.	Streamline processes, automate more	Tue, 3/14/06 10:56 AM
5.	Nothing	Tue, 3/14/06 10:00 AM
6.	There needs to be a common understanding about the meaning of the regs and a mechanism to resolve "grey" issues quickly and fairly. Certification process is far too lengthy. All of this could be simplified if new public law requiring receprocity were being implemented. This law was sponsored by Senator Jim Talent and was signed into law last year. Why isn't it being observed? Please reference position by the National Black Chamber of Commerce at: http://www.nationalbcc.org/press/article.asp?id=240&scope=press	Tue, 3/14/06 7:57 AM
7.	Tell the truth about the length of time it takes to process applications. Follow through when you say you will. Hire more staff. By the way, this survey is filled with misspelled words.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:07 AM
8.	Review the website. If I can self serve on some of my inquiries, I can reduce my blundering phone calls to the KCMO offices. However, when I call, everyone is ready to help. And quite honestly, I am happy to call them because of this courteousness.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:05 AM
9.	I've had the opportunity to work with a number of staff members of the Human Relations Dept. Whether helping me resolve issues, addressing my concerns or simply answering questions I have, they have become a valuable resource to me. I have had a positive experience working with this department.	Tue, 3/14/06 7:03 AM
10.	please response to my email.	Tue, 3/14/06 6:57 AM
11.	The call backs and answering the phone was the real problem in past times. No one wanted to or did call back. This last time they took care of all the concerns when I called instead of putting me in voice mail.	Mon, 3/13/06 7:25 AM
12.	If the person who answers the phone or is at the counter cannot answer the question, then that person should refer customer to a person who can answer immediately or give the customer a person to contact by name and extension.	Thu, 3/9/06 9:22 AM
13.	I would like to know how to get on the bid list. How do I make sure my commodity codes are correct. I do not want to miss out on opportunities to do business with the City. I am an MBE and want to know if there are training programs letting small businesses know how to do and how to get business with the City of KC.	Wed, 3/8/06 6:28 PM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

14.	Hire intelligent, educated people who treat each customer with equal dignity regardless of status, political connections, race or other characteristics. For a "Human Relations" department this might be one of the most racist and sexist groups I have dealt with in a long time.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:34 AM
15.	It seems you don't have enough help.	Wed, 3/8/06 7:25 AM
16.	Even when the process and information are not perfect, having staff trained to be professional, friendly and helpful would make up for a lot of the other inadequacies.	Tue, 3/7/06 8:09 PM
17.	Train employees to listen before anticipating their solution to the problem.	Tue, 3/7/06 10:06 AM
18.	Have knowledge of thier job and ordiances.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:33 AM
19.	I do think with all the construction taking place in our city that we need to insure that the general contractors give opportunities to the M/WBE contractors and not be issued waivers. Also on some of these fast tract projects insuring that they are broken down into smaller packages so that they are manageable for smaller sub-contractors to bond and finance. Also, their is a cap on size standards for sub-contractors and this seems to be waived for a few contractors in our industry. I would welcome the opportunity to speak with you in person on this subject.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:32 AM
20.	Get a realistic view of what you need and request it upfront. Whatever is needed should be itemized and disclosed at the first contact. If you miss it,,, the customer should't be required to go back again and again.	Tue, 3/7/06 6:02 AM
21.	Make sure that every city contract has a MBE goal. Make sure that the goal requires direct industry involvement.Make sure that the primes understand that these items will be enforced or they WILL NOT get the contract.	Mon, 3/6/06 5:18 PM
22.	Don't let the city council make any more decisions like last weeks. I think due to the high volume of construction and applicants, anybody would have a hard time responding in a timely manner with the staff provided.	Mon, 3/6/06 4:00 PM
23.	Hire more staff and be more responses.	Mon, 3/6/06 1:24 PM
24.	BE CONSISTENT IN THE APPLICATION OF POLICY. You should also have a procedure for dispute resolution when there is a disagreement on how policy should be applied.	Mon, 3/6/06 11:52 AM
25.	SEE ABOVE	Mon, 3/6/06 11:12 AM
26.	Enrich the website experience to help alleviate the live customer contact. I feel that I may have made individuals in the office perform tasks that were not value added, however, I appreciated that they took the time to answer and assist me.	Mon, 3/6/06 9:24 AM
27.	No improvement needed.	Mon, 3/6/06 9:01 AM
28.	The department may need more staff to address all of its public monitoring responsibilities effectively.	Mon, 3/6/06 8:49 AM
29.	Wow, that is a question that can not be answered in this small space. I do however, see a huge attempt to move in this direction of improvement. I like what I see happening in the world of MBE/WBE and true certifiction. Now we have to really see some true opportinities for our business. I am celebrating 25 years in business and it gets harder every day to stay in business!!! Thanks for asking *Marsha Ross/Window Treatments & More!	Mon, 3/6/06 7:55 AM

Customer Satisfaction Survey from 2006 conducted by PStrada

30.	Keep up the good work.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:23 AM
31.	Fix the Peoplesoft application, and ensure the HR staff are do not discount quailty applicatants because of system related problems.	Mon, 3/6/06 7:08 AM
32.	Getting certifications in a timely matter.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:52 AM
33.	The process of being certified as a woman owned business was handled in a very professional manner.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:45 AM
34.	I liked getting contact with Mike Hughes - he made me feel like he was "in my corner". I believe the system has one issue - but I am not sure if it is a problem. Sometimes, I feel reluctant to call HRD if I am having a problem with my prime becasue I feel like I could "win the battle but lose the war" - so I am hestitant to call them all the time. (Maybe this is how it should be). One time I had a problem getting a subcontract executed even though I had been working almost 10 months on the project. Esther made some phone calls and I had a contract within a week. The prime was a little cranky to me after that (but they recently hired me for another project so I guess they weren't that mad.)	Mon, 3/6/06 6:42 AM
35.	Add additional staff to share the workload. This will enable staff to thouroughly investigate MBE/WBE utilization on projects.	Mon, 3/6/06 6:38 AM
36.	The customer service has been exceptional. This was my first experience with HRD outside the WBE Certification process. I had no idea how supportive HRD would be to me and my firm. It is nice to know someone is looking out for us. Ollie is very professional and thorough.	Thu, 2/23/06 11:55 AM

50 responses per page

Back to Table of Contents