

## AUDIT REPORT TRACKING SYSTEM (ARTS)

<b>SECTION I: SUMMARY INFORMATION</b>			
<b>Audit Title:</b>	Recommended Practices Would Strengthen Hotline Operations	<b>Audit Release Date:</b>	08/31/2016
<b>Department:</b>	City Manager's Office	<b>Last Report Date:</b>	09/26/2018
<b>Department Director:</b>	Troy Schulte	<b>This Report Date:</b>	02/25/2019
<b>Contact Person/Phone:</b>	Gwen Stafne	<b>Expected Presentation Date:</b>	CAO will enter
<b>SECTION II: RECORD OF IMPLEMENTED RECOMMENDATIONS</b>			
1. Implemented 12/17/17		5. Implemented prior to 12/17/17	
2. Implemented 9/21/18		6. Implemented prior to 12/17/17	
3. Implemented 9/21/18		7. Implemented 12/17/17	
4. Implemented 12/17/17		8. Implemented 2/11/19	
<b>SECTION III: SUMMARY OF IMPLEMENTATION EFFORTS</b>			
<b>Recommendation 2:</b> The city manager should periodically test how the contractor handles calls and records case information.			
<i>Status of Recommendation: Implemented</i>			
The Ethics Hotline was tested September 21, 2018. The Ethics Compliance Officer made an anonymous call to the hotline. It was handled by the contractor perfectly. This provides more confidence in the accuracy of reports made to the hotline.			
<b>Recommendation 3:</b> The city manager should develop written policies and procedures for the city's hotline program that incorporate recommended hotline practices.			
<i>Status of Recommendation: Implemented</i>			
The Ethics Hotline Policy and Procedures document was completed September 21, 2018 and updated in November 2018. This document provides guidance on how to handle hotline calls and should be useful as a job manual. (See attached.)			
<b>Recommendation 8:</b> The city manager should consolidate hotline and hotline-type cases, and analyze and publicly report hotline statistics and summary outcomes annually.			
<i>Status of Recommendation: Implemented</i>			
A calendar year 2018 report of Ethics Hotline calls was posted to the City's website February 11, 2019. There is a link to the report on the Ethics Hotline page. This report provides more transparency to our citizens and employees. (See attached.)			
<b>SECTION IV: ADDITIONAL OUTCOMES</b>			

## Ethics Hotline Policy and Procedures

Ethics Hotline calls are received by our outside contractor NAVEX. A new case is opened for each new report and a case number is assigned with the format: CKC-18-07-0001 (18 is the year, 7 is the month, 1 means the first case of the month). The call can be anonymous or the caller can provide their name and contact information if they desire. The caller can call NAVEX back with the case number and a pin provided by NAVEX to see what the City is doing/has done to investigate their report. The software can be accessed and updated by the two City employees set up with NAVEX. Currently one City employee is in charge of the Ethics Hotline calls and the other individual is the backup.

NAVEX assigns a priority to each call: A, B, or C. An email is sent to two employees with the City of Kansas City for each Ethics Hotline call. For category A calls, the highest priority, NAVEX will also call the City employee on file to make sure they know a category A report has been made. Also, when a reporter calls in to check the status of their previous report or to add information, emails are sent to the two City employees on file.

Instructions when call/report is received:

Update the NAVEX site/software to show what action is being taken (i.e.: under investigation and the information has been sent to the Director of Neighborhoods) within five workdays of receiving the call. Update the Ethics Excel spreadsheet to show report number, date received, date NAVEX updated, who the report was sent to, and a short case summary.

Most reports will be sent to the department director affected by the call. People named in reports by the caller should not be investigating the report. Generally, if a person is named or accused of something in a report, that person should be the last one you interview. Get the details, fact-finding, and other involved party interviews done first. Address all allegations. Assume witnesses are not guilty.

Most cases should be completed within 30-45 days. If a director has not reported the case status after 30 days, send an email asking if the case is complete and how it was handled. Send more follow up emails every few weeks until every case is closed. When closing a case in NAVEX, note the steps taken so the caller can see that their concerns have been addressed. Edit the file status to show the case is closed. Edit the Ethics Excel spreadsheet with the actions taken, the date the case was closed in NAVEX, and whether the facts alleged in the call were substantiated or not.

Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) cases should be sent to the EEO people in Human Resources and the case should be closed in NAVEX. Other possible Human Resources cases should be emailed to the Director of Human Resources so he can decide if HR will handle.

A copy of the Ethics Excel spreadsheet without names of parties involved should be emailed to the Ethics Commission before each Ethics Commission meeting. The Ethics Commission likes to review the sort of calls the City is receiving and how they are handled.

Calls should be summarized after the end of each calendar year. This information should be made available to the public on the City's website.

An annual fiscal year report (Case Overview Report) will need to be prepared out of the NAVEX software in May for the external auditors (Analysis/Summary Reports/Report By: Overview/Date-between- 05/01/XX and 04/30/XX send to Excel format).

## Ethics Hotline Report for Calendar Year 2018

The City of Kansas City, Missouri has an Ethics Hotline, which provides employees and residents a way to anonymously report suspected abuse and wrongdoing by elected officials, members of appointed boards and commissions, City employees, contract employees, vendors, bidders and anyone doing business with the City.

Ethics Hotline calls are received by a City-contracted vendor on the East Coast. The company sends an email to the City's Ethics Compliance Officer each time the Ethics Hotline is called. Callers can choose to leave their name or the calls can be anonymous. The hotline number is 800-340-3132.

- New calls/reports to the hotline received in 2018: 108
- Hotline calls that were not City issues, referred to outside agencies (i.e. Police, Counties, HUD): 25
- Calls that were substantiated or partially substantiated: 23
- Calls that were unsubstantiated: 35
- Calls where the investigation is still open (as of January 31, 2019): 5
- Calls where the outcome was undetermined (i.e. not enough information provided by the caller, forwarded to Human Resources as an EEO case) 20

### Types and Numbers of New City-Related Calls Received (108 calls – 25 referrals = 83)

<u>Types of New Calls 2018</u>	<u># Calls</u>	<u>Substantiated</u>	<u>Unsubstantiated</u>	<u>Undetermined</u>	<u>Case Still Open</u>
Other	12	7	3	2	
General Concern	9	5	2	2	
Workplace Conduct	10	4	4	1	1
Time Abuse	7	3	4		
EEO	7			7	
Conflict of Interest	5	1	4		
Harassment	5		4	1	
Customer Service	4		2	1	1
Fraud	4		3		1
Safety	3		1	1	1
Discrimination	3		1	2	
Request for Guidance	3		1	2	
Residency	3	1	1		1
Alcohol & Drug Abuse	2		2		
Retaliation	2		1	1	
Romantic Behavior	1		1		
Competition	1		1		
Environmental Concern	1	1			
Threats & Physical Violence	1	1			
	83	23	35	20	5

### Calls by Department

<b>Department</b>	<b># Calls</b>	<b>Substantiated</b>	<b>Unsubstantiated</b>	<b>Undetermined</b>	<b>Case Still Open</b>
Aviation	7	4	3		
Finance	2	1			1
Fire	10	3	4	3	
General Services	4	2	2		
Health	7	1	4	2	
Human Resources	8			8	
Human Relations	2		2		
Law	2		2		
Municipal Court	1			1	
Neighborhoods	20	9	7	4	
Parks	3		1		2
Public Works	5		4	1	
Water	12	3	6	1	2
	<b>83</b>	<b>23</b>	<b>35</b>	<b>20</b>	<b>5</b>

**New Ethics Hotline calls received in the last three years:**

